HULA Code Book

Humanities and Liberal Arts Assessment

The HULA Research Team
Project Zero
Harvard University
August 11, 2016

HULA

HULA Code Book

Humanities and Liberal Arts Assessment

The HULA Research Team
Project Zero
Harvard University
August 11, 2016

The HULA Research Team
Danielle Allen
Chris Dean
Maggie Schein
Sheena Kang
Melanie Webb
Annie Walton Doyle

DISCLAIMER: The content provided in this code book is intended solely for general information purposes, and is provided with the understanding that the authors and publishers are not herein engaged in rendering consulting or other professional advice or services. The practice of consulting is driven by specific circumstances unique to each project. Consequently, any use of this information should be done only in consultation with a qualified professional who can take into account all relevant factors and desired outcomes. The information in this code book was posted with reasonable care and attention. However, it is possible that some information in this code book is incomplete, incorrect, or inapplicable to particular circumstances or conditions. We do not accept liability for direct or indirect losses resulting from using, relying or acting upon information in this code book.

Contents

Part 1: Introducing HULA 8
I.1: Introduction
I.2: Overview of Qualitative Data Analysis Procedure and Workflow
I.3: Definitions
I.4: Overview of Descriptors
I.5: Overview of Codes

Part II: Archive Management 15
II.1: Archive Acquisition
II.2: Archive Preparation & Curation

Part III: Applying Descriptors 17
III.1: Introduction
III. 2: Descriptor Function
III. 3: Descriptor List and Explanations

Part IV: Coding: Understanding the Artifact 24
IV. 1: Excerpting Procedures
IV.2: Creating Memos

Part V: Coding: Understanding the Codes 29
V.1: Understanding the Codes
V. 2: Source Codes
V. 3: Craft Logic Codes
V. 4: Codes for Perceptual Domains Engaged
V. 5: Codes for Psychological Capacities Deployed
V. 6: Codes for Types of Intellectual/Personality Development
V. 7: Codes for Types of Human Development
V. 8: Document Type and Coding

Contents *continued*

Part VI: Samples & Commentary 87
VI.1: Application of Descriptors to Sample Document
VI. 2: Application of Codes to Sample Excerpt

Part VII: Analysis of Data 94
VII. 1: Introduction
VII. 2: Folk Learning Theories
VII. 3: Elements of Craft
VII. 4: Developmental Pathways
VII. 5: Mechanisms at Work
VII. 6: From Analysis to Assessment Instruments

Appendix A: Code Glossary. 99

Appendix B: Bibliography. 106

Icons used in this book:

Code

Descriptors

Definition

Explanation

Example

Parameters

Note

Part 1:
Introducing HULA

Part I: Introducing HULA

I.1: Introduction

Return to Table of Contents

Founded in 2012, the Humanities and Liberal Arts Assessment (HULA) research team has taken on the project of understanding the theories of learning and human development that lie at the heart of the humanities. Professional humanists— individuals who hold advanced degrees in humanities subjects and/or work in the professional domains of the humanities— have been passing on their practices and craft knowledge for millennia through master-apprentice relationships. Our project is to make the implicit craft knowledge and practices of these disciplines explicit. The value in illuminating the craft knowledge of the goals of the humanities, as well as the methods and mechanisms by which those goals can be achieved, is that assessment then becomes possible via instruments developed organically out of humanists' practice.

HULA's goal is to formalize the craft knowledge of master humanists and the self-understandings of successful apprentices to identify more clearly the anticipated human development outcomes of humanistic education. This research project also provides the foundational tools for developing new assessment instruments that emerge organically out of humanistic practice.

Parts I.2, I.3, I.4 and I.5 cover HULA's general qualitative data analysis (QDA) procedure. They provide an overview of workflow, definitions of key terms and concepts, and a basic overview of descriptors and codes. Parts II.1 and II.2, discuss archive acquisition, preparation for coding, and curation. Parts III.1, III.2, and III.3, cover the function, application and definitions of descriptors. Part IV outlines excerpting procedures. Parts V.1 - V.7 define and discuss the six code categories and their sub-categories. V.8 discusses different document types and their impact on excerpting practices as well as coding application. Parts VI.1 and VI.2 provide examples of and commentary on descriptor and code application to sample documents from different archives. Part VII, chapters 1, 2, 3, and 4 discuss our approach to analyzing the data. Chapter 5 discusses the possible applications of our analyses in the creation of new assessment instruments.

I.2: Overview of Qualitative Data Analysis Procedure and Workflow

Return to Table of Contents

The five phases of the HULA research project workflow are: (1) Acquisition of an archive of material that is the result of humanist practitioners' work; (2) via application of HULA codes and descriptors to the archived materials, study of the craft logic, or major outcomes, humanist practitioners achieve, or aim to achieve, their methods of reaching those goals, and the means by which they expect those methods to work; (3) identification of both learning theories and criteria of successful intellectual and human development implicit in humanist craft practices; (4) identification of existing assessment instruments that effectively assess the learning outcomes identified as important to humanist practitioners; and (5) development of new assessment instruments for the implicit learning outcomes illuminated by HULA's coding procedure as well as for those that humanists explicitly articulate and for which there are no suitable pre-existing instruments.

I.3: Definitions

Return to Table of Contents

Archive:
Master humanists, as well as their apprentices and those who participate in the humanities, produce materials in the execution of their practices. Some of these are the creative products of the master humanists themselves, some are material artifacts generated by their research, creative, pedagogic, and performative practices, and some are descriptions of those practices, their results, or their material footprint. These sorts of materials may include books, essays, studies, lesson plans, syllabi, comments on student work, samples of student or participant work, grant proposals and requests, evaluations, videos, etc. In an archive, individual items such as these are called ***artifacts***. Each artifact is a single document, video, audio clip, etc. Each artifact is a separate "Media Item" in *Dedoose*, which is the qualitative data analysis software we use.

Qualitative data analysis (QDA):

QDA involves tailored use of a large and eclectic range of methods and procedures (see Qualitative Data Analysis: *A Methods Source Book*). HULA uses a combination of metadata tags called "**descriptors**" and thematic "**codes**." The "descriptors" are attached to each **artifact** while the "codes" are applied to **excerpts** within each artifact. Descriptors identify key features of the artifact itself (for instance, source, date, or demographic information); codes describe salient contents in the artifact. This combination of the stable meta-data of descriptors with the varied descriptive data from coding permits us to identify and analyze meaningful patterns and relationships within individual archives as well as across archives.

Descriptors:

Descriptors are metadata tags (information that identifies the artifact as a whole so that it can be compared and analyzed with other artifacts); those metadata tags indicate dates, locations, demographic information about participants, etc.

Codes:

Codes are thematic labels used to identify salient elements in the artifacts. Code generation, definition, and application evolves with the acquisition of new types of archives.

Analysis:

After artifacts are tagged with descriptors, their contents are excerpted, and the excerpts are coded, we deploy qualitative and quantitative analytic tools to identify patterns and investigate themes within and across archives. In particular, we (1) identify the key elements and goals of various humanistic crafts; (2) identify humanistic folk learning theories; (3) identify developmental pathways pursued by humanists; (4) uncover the "mechanisms at work" along those developmental pathways; and (5) evaluate existing assessment instruments in relation to both implicit and explicit desired learning outcomes.

I.4: General Overview of Descriptors

Return to Table of Contents

Descriptors are "metadata" tags that capture information at the level of the whole artifact. For instance, in a library catalog entry for a book, the information about author, date of publication, and title are "metadata" elements that permit identification of the book as well as comparison of the book to other books (was it published before or after some other book? should it be shelved to the left or to the right of some other book?).

HULA descriptors capture four categories of information that are relevant to each artifact taken as a whole: (1) the demographic profile of those participating in the humanistic practice described or embodied in the artifact; (2) the disciplinary profile of the humanistic practice described or embodied in the artifact; (3) the type and scale of activity described or embodied in the artifact; and (4) the type or genre of document itself.

HULA's Descriptors will be presented at length in Part III *(Part III: Applying Descriptors)*. Descriptor Categories include: (1) Demographic Profile; (2) Disciplinary Profile; (3) Activity Profile; and (4) Document or Media Profile.

I.5: General Overview of Codes

Return to Table of Contents

Codes are thematic labels that capture elemental data in each artifact. Coders select excerpts within artifacts and apply codes to them in accordance with their collective interpretation of the data and the definitions of the individual codes (see *Part V: Coding: Understanding the Codes*).

The qualitative coding structure has two levels. Coders answer first order (or top level) questions and second order (or second level) questions. The first order codes capture the "source of the excerpt" and "elements of craft." The "source of the excerpt" is the speaker of the material captured in the excerpt. The speaker may be a teacher/facilitator; a student/participant; a bridger; a third party observer; or the organization itself. The "elements of craft" are the goals, methods, and mechanisms (or causal explanations offered about the relationship between methods and goals) that structure a humanist's craft practice. This combination of goals,

methods, mechanisms, and assessment methods constitutes the "craft logic" deployed by the humanist practitioner. We comb our archives for excerpts that call out these elements of craft.

The second order codes capture features of each craft element that connect it to a process of human development. We are interested in determining the following: 1) what are the perceptual capacities the humanist's practice or craft engages? (2) What are the psychological capacities the humanist's practice deploys? (3) What forms of intellectual and personality developments are aimed at or achieved by the practices; and (4) What are the longer-term human development goals of the practices?

Sometimes craft elements are conveyed in humanists' descriptions of their craft. Sometimes they are embodied in the actual practices of master and/or student humanists. For instance, a classroom discussion is an embodiment of a master humanist's method rather than a description of it. HULA's interest is to capture humanists' description of their practices, the embodiment of their practices, and the results of their actual practices. Any given archive of a master humanist's work is likely to have components of both description and embodiment.

When coding, coders ask: (1) What element of the craft is captured by this excerpt? (2) What perceptual domains are described as being engaged (for descriptive excerpts) or are in fact engaged in this excerpt (for embodied excerpts)? (3) What psychological capacities are described as being deployed (for descriptive excerpts) or are in fact being deployed in this excerpt (for embodied excerpts)? (4) What types of intellectual or personality capacity are under development by the humanist in this excerpt, whether as a matter of description or embodiment? (5) What long-term human life course outcomes are under development by the humanist in this excerpt, whether as a matter of description or embodiment?

Coding involves two steps. First, coders identify the source of an excerpt and the element of craft logic (goal, method, mechanism, and assessment) that it captures. Second, coders identify how each craft element is connected to perceptual forms of intake, psychological forms of processing, intellectual and personality development, and long-term existential, civic or vocational goals.

HULA's Codes are presented at length in *Part V: Coding: Understanding the Codes*. For now, here is the list of Codes.

COMPLETE LIST OF CODES

Source

- Facilitator
- Student-Participant
- Bridger
- Organization
- Observer
- Unknown

Craft Logic

- Goal
- Method
- Mechanism
- Assessment

Perceptual Domains Engaged

- Verbal
- Visual
- Aural (musical, non-verbal auditory)
- Behavioral (modeling or demonstration)
- Kinesthetic
- Memory

Psychological Capacities Deployed

- Cognitive-Analytical
- Cognitive-Imaginative
- Cognitive-Undetermined
- Meta-Cognitive
- Affective
- Intersubjective
- Kinesthetic

COMPLETE LIST OF CODES *continued...*

Types of Intellectual/Personality Development

- *Literacy- Basic*
- *Literacy- Advanced*
- *Communicative Skill*
- *Critical Thinking*
- *Understanding*
- *Appreciation*
- *Creativity*
- *Practical Judgment*
- *Kinesthetic Developmental*
- *Personality Factors*

Types of Human Development

- *Civic*
- *Vocational*
- *Existential*

Part 2:
Archive Management

Part 2: Archive Management

II.1: Archive Acquisition

Return to Table of Contents

The HULA team identifies a defined body of work provided by a master humanist, set of humanists, or humanistic institution or organization. With permission from the source organization and in accordance with ethical and institutional responsibilities, the HULA team then submits an Institutional Review Board (IRB) application to seek approval for the data acquisition, curation, and further analysis. Upon securing approval from the IRB, the contents are organized via a preliminary process of analysis and cataloging.

II.2: Archive Preparation & Curation

Return to Table of Contents

After the HULA team has identified an archive and secured IRB approval for the project, the team prepares the archive for uploading into the QDA and storage software. If the archive consists of analog materials, these are then digitized in OCR formats, and the originals are properly secured in accordance with the provider's instructions and IRB requirements. If the archive is digital, it must be reviewed to confirm that the artifacts are in OCR formats. In both cases, materials must be de-identified as per IRB requirements. As with any analog artifacts, access, management, and storage of digital artifacts will be kept secure and in accordance with IRB and institutional protocols. These foundational processes also permit the research team a preliminary overview of the complete contents of the archive, which will be valuable in further phases of analysis. The research director develops a naming protocol for the artifacts in the archive that preserves information about the document provided in the naming protocol of the provider, and that also permits easy identification of documents within HULA's management, storage and QDA processes.

Note: Dedoose is the qualitative data analysis software that HULA currently uses. Many documents uploaded into Dedoose are scanned in. Some are better quality and more intact than others. If you encounter any of questionable excerptability, please code as much as is legible and make a note in the cover memo that coding was incomplete or compromised due to document quality. If coders encounter an uncodable document, alert the HULA research director or archive master, who may have access to a more legible version.

Part 3:
Applying Descriptors

Part 3: Applying Descriptors

III.1: Introduction

Return to Table of Contents

Descriptors are metadata tags that describe the artifact as a unit, capturing such information as demographics of audience, size of audience, etc.; disciplines represented in the artifact; activity types represented in the artifact; and the document type (grant, student paper, faculty comments, organizational document, hybrids, etc.) represented by the artifact. The HULA Descriptor Categories are: (1) Demographic Profile; (2) Disciplinary Profile; (3) Activity Profile; and (4) Document Profile.

III.2: Descriptor Function

Return to Table of Contents

Demographic Profile

FIELD	MEMO	OPTIONS
Accessibility	How accessible is the program? Is it free or not?	• Fee • Free
Socioeconomic status		• Low • High • Mixed • Unclear
Ethnicity		• Predominantly Native American • Predominantly Black • Predominantly Latino/a • Mixed • Predominantly White • Predominantly Asian
Age of students/audience		• Mixed • Children (up to 12) • Seniors (65+) • Youth (12-22) • Adults
Size of participant group		• <8 • >22 • 9-22
Geographic location		
Date		

Disciplinary Profile

FIELD	MEMO	TYPE	OPTIONS
Media	Type of material used in the instruction or program.	List	• Textual • Cinematic • Kinetic • Aural • Theatrical • Visual
Discipline 1		List	• Anthropology • Language and Lit-Spanish • Economics • Geography • Performing Arts • Psychology • Linguistics • Classics • Environmental Humanities • Language and Lit-English • Visual Arts (creative) • Creative Writing • Language and Lit-East Asian • History • Religion • Art History • Sociology • Music (history and theory) • Digital Humanities • Philosophy • Political Science
Discipline 2 *(next page)*			

Disciplinary Profile Continued...

FIELD	MEMO	TYPE	OPTIONS
Discipline 2		List	• Music (history and theory) • Language and Lit-English • Economics, Art History • Digital Humanities • Language and LIt-Spanish • Anthropology • Psychology • Philosophy • Political Science • Creative Writing • Visual Arts (creative) • Sociology • Language and LIt-East Asian • Geography • Performing Arts • Linguistics • Environmental Humanities • History • Classics • Religion • N/A
Discipline 3		List	• Language and Lit-East • Asian • History • Music (history and theory) • Sociology • Linguistics • Political Science • Religion • Performing Arts • Geography • Language and Lit-Spanish • Visual Arts (creative) • Anthropology • Digital Humanities • Psychology • Language and LIt-English • Creative Writing • Classics • Environmental Humanities • Economics • Philosophy • N/A
Discipline 4 *(next page)*			

Disciplinary Profile Continued...

FIELD	MEMO	TYPE	OPTIONS
Discipline 4		List	• Visual Arts (creative) • History • Language and Lit-Spanish • Environmental Humanities • Art History • Linguistics • Psychology • Classics • Economics • Digital Humanities • Performing Arts • Anthropology • Language and Lit-East Asian • Language and Lit-English • Music (history and theory) • Political Science • Sociology • Geography • Philosophy • Religion • Creative Writing • N/A
More than 4 Disciplines		List	• Yes • No

Activity Profile

FIELD	MEMO	TYPE	OPTIONS
Interactive?		List	• Yes • No
Activity Type		List	• Lecture • Course • Workshop • Discussion • Other Public Program

Document Profile

FIELD	MEMO	TYPE	OPTIONS
Genre		List	• Reading Guide • Hybrid of instructor and participant • Instructor/ Facilitator Comment • Not Relevant for Project • Publicity Materials • Grant Proposal • Statement of the value of the humanities • Student comments • Training Guides
Archival Source	What organization or individual produced this document?	List	• IH • People and Stories • Princeton • Amherst • Humanists • Harford Community College
Data Type	Does the artifact contain quantitative or qualitative data, or both?	List	• Hybrid • Qualitative • Quantitative
Description vs Embodiment		List	• Descriptive Document • Embodied Document • Hybrid

Each archive consists of artifacts that may fall into a number of different categories. Thus far, the HULA team has encountered: grant proposals, reading guides, instructor/ facilitator comments, student comments, hybrid documents that contain material generated by both instructors and participants, publicity materials, general statements of the value of

the humanities, training guides, and faculty comments on student work. It is important to recognize, at the start of working with any given document, what type it represents. Generic features of the artifact will affect the coding process. For instance, each element of craft logic may be more explicitly stated in a descriptive text, while those elements are likely to be more implicit in an embodied text. The impact of document type on the coding process will be discussed more fully in *Part IV: Coding: Understanding the Artifact*.

III.3: Procedure for Linking and Editing Descriptors in Dedoose

Return to Table of Contents

- To link a new descriptor, click on the green descriptor button from the home document. Click on the relevant set field, click the "create and link" descriptor.
- To edit already linked descriptors, click on desired descriptor set category (Demographic, Discipline, Activity, Document), click on green highlighted link, and edit from the drop down menus there. Do not use the "create and link" button for editing. If you encounter a document that you feel the current descriptors don't capture, that kind of observation is import to recond, so please include it in your cover memo (See *IV.3: Creating Memos*)

Application Notes

- Age of Students or Audience: if the project explicitly engages the teachers (gives them curricula, trains them, etc.) and the students, or the students and a general adult audience, use the "mixed" descriptor.
- Geographic Location: state and country (if not USA) is sufficient.

Part 4: Coding: Understanding the Artifact

Part 4: Coding: Understanding the Artifact

IV.1: Coding Procedures

Return to Table of Contents

The coding procedure involves 6 steps:

1. Coders read the entire artifact in order to glean a global understanding of the craft logic at work in the artifact and to identify the source(s) of the excerpt. Any given artifact may consist of excerpts produced by different sources, as for instance, when a document records both a teacher's questions and a student's answers.

2. Coders apply descriptors (*Part III: Applying Descriptors*).

3. Coders excerpt without coding (*Part IV: Coding: Understanding the Artifact*); each excerptable unit should represent a distinct element of craft (goal, method, mechanism, or assessment). Each excerpt must have one and only one craft logic code.

4. Coders conduct a first round of coding and code each excerpt for first-order codes ONLY (Source, Craft Logic) (*Part V: Coding: Understanding the Codes*).

5. Coders conduct a second round of coding and code each excerpt for second-order codes (Perceptual Domain, Psychological Capacity, Intellectual/Personality Development, and Human Development). (*Part V: Coding: Understanding the Codes*). Excerpts should be coded with as few (including zero) and as many codes from each of the second-order code families as are necessary to capture the content of the excerpt. It is not necessary to apply a code from every code family. If an excerpt does not provide sufficient content to identity a developmental element, do not apply codes from the two developmental code families.

6. After coding, Coders create a "Cover memo"(*IV.3: Creating Memos*) for each document. Cover memos should log general observations about the document and any interesting patterns/anomalies in coding (or in the documents themselves) that you feel may not be captured in our current codes or coding practices.

IV.2: Excerpting Procedures

Return to Table of Contents

An excerpt is a selection of text or video within an artifact. Coders initially excerpt without coding, but each excerpted unit should represent a distinct element of craft (goal, method, mechanism, or assessment). Excerpts vary in length, and the number of excerpts in each artifact will depend on the document profile of the artifact. Excerpts might be as short as a phrase within a sentence or as long as multiple paragraphs. Excerpts should capture sufficient context so that even in isolation from the full context, and paired with codes applied to them, they can be analyzed. For instance, when excerpting descriptions of conversations, each excerpt should capture a moment in the arc of the conversation. That is, each excerpt should be moving the conversation along in some observable way, and the string of excerpts represents the "stages" or "steps" in the conversation.

Note: Not all descriptions of conversations will contain a conversational "arc." In the case of a report of a conversation that consists of a prompt and lists of responses, excerpt the section as one unit in order to provide sufficient context for the responses.

Similarly, when a document consists of questions paired with answers, it may be necessary to excerpt the questions as a complete set (to be coded "method") and individual pairs of questions and answers together, so that the answer can be coded with awareness of the context of the prompt that generated it.

Finally, some passages or selections need to be excerpted multiple times. A single sentence or set of sentences may, for instance, convey a goal, a method, and a mechanism simultaneously. In such a case, the passage would be excerpted three times and coded once as a goal excerpt, once as a method excerpt, and once as a mechanism excerpt.

Further Notes on Three Excerpting Strategies:

1. Excerpting for Craft Logic First: Pick out the element of craft logic, look at units of craft logic, then apply relevant code. This strategy is most often used for artifacts such as grant proposals, newspaper articles, and such.

2. Excerpting for Conversational Arc: (see explanation above): A conversational arc comprises the chronological steps or the flow of interactions that constitute a coherent and discrete segment of a discussion. This strategy is closely related to the first, but differs in its emphasis and focus on the thematic coherence of the excerpt. In this approach, one could create an excerpt relevant to the conversational arc without first identifying the craft logic element, and then return to the question of craft logic.

3. Excerpting for Conversational Mechanisms: A conversational mechanism is the conversational spark, or cause, that spurs a series of distinct but related conversational arcs. In excerpting for Conversational Mechanisms, coders are looking for mechanisms, and then go back and fill out other codes.

Note 1: Conversational Mechanisms can overlap. Coders should ask: how much do I need to capture for the whole of a specific mechanism? It is important to recognize overlap when the ending of one Conversational Mechanism is also the starting point of the next. Coders should be aware of how a conversation gets moved along, like interlocking gears.

Note 2: Conversational Mechanisms. It is important to recognize when conversational mechanisms are separated by other content, but are, nonetheless, part of the system of interlocking gears that keeps the conversational arc moving.

Note 3: While excerpts that capture moments in Conversational Arcs may often be re-excerpted as excerpts that capture a Conversational Mechanism, not all Conversational Arcs will be double excerpted in this fashion. There will not always be sufficient causal language or consistency across Conversational Arcs to link them together as related parts of a single mechanism.

IV.3: Creating Memos

Return to Table of Contents

Memo writing is an important tool for the qualitative researcher. Memos serve multiple functions. They are summaries of an artifact and records of the researcher's experience with the artifact. Memos document questions about the artifact's archival quality, particular points of interest within it, concerns about the HULA's coding system's capacity to capture relevant information in the artifact, researcher's biases, and in general, the diverse and rich responses of HULA researchers to archives, artifacts, and elements within artifacts.

Coders create a cover or summary memo of each artifact they code, in which they describe the kind of document they are coding, apparent themes, and any procedural concerns. Other questions, observations, or conceptual interests should be memoed separately. *(See Qualitative Data Analysis, Pages 93-99, Miles, Matthew B., A. Michael Huberman, and Johnny Saldana).*

Part 5: Coding: Understanding the Codes

Part 5: Coding: Understanding the Codes

V.1: Understanding the Codes

Return to Table of Contents

HULA's codes are designed to bring to light and to formalize the implicit understandings of humanistic craft practices. The HULA team helps illuminate the skeletal structure of humanities crafts: the goals, methods, mechanisms, and techniques of assessment. HULA works with the humanists' description of their crafts, materials emanating from the actual practice of the craft, and, when available, the results of the practices. Once one identifies these "elements of craft," one can ask questions about the human development project to which that element of craft is connected. The second-order HULA codes (for perceptual domain engaged, psychological capacities deployed, intellectual and personality capacities developed, and long-term human development) are meant to cast a wide net to catch the elemental learning pathways that humanists pursue and to invite key questions about those pedagogic practices. The codes focus on those aspects of psychological and intellectual engagement that are most closely connected to language rather than to quantitative reasoning. But for that limitation, the codes are meant to be expansive enough in their combinatorial possibility to permit the potential identification of a vast array of purposes and methods within humanists' fields of activity.

The HULA code structure is designed to make it possible to identify the learning pathways that connect the engagement of the student or participant's perceptual faculties to modes of activity and the deployment of distinct psychological capacities, and from there to types of short-term and long-term development (intellectual and personality capacities in the nearer term; general forms of human development, such as existential, civic or vocational, in the longer term). HULA seeks to discover which learning pathways, from within a vast set of possibilities, are more commonly selected by humanists, or sub-groups of humanists. The team then collaborates with psychologists and educational specialists to create stronger modes of assessing success at the deployment of those common learning pathways.

Each chapter in Part V is dedicated to one of the code categories. The first-order codes capture the sources of excerpts and elements of craft, and the second-order codes capture salient features of those elements of craft, which, taken together, permit the identification of the learning pathways to which they are connected.

Code List

V.2: Source Codes

- Facilitator
- Student-Participant
- Bridger
- Organization
- Observer
- Unknown

V.3: Craft Logic Codes

- Goal
- Method
- Mechanism
- Assessment

V.4: Perceptual Domains Engaged Codes

- Verbal
- Visual
- Aural (musical, non-verbal auditory)
- Behavioral (modeling or demonstration)
- Kinesthetic
- Memory

V.5: Psychological Capacities Deployed Codes

- Cognitive-Analytical
- Cognitive-Imaginative
- Cognitive-Undetermined
- Meta-Cognitive
- Affective
- Intersubjective
- Kinesthetic

V.6: Types of Intellectual/Personality Development Codes

- Literacy- Basic
- Literacy- Advanced
- Communicative Skill
- Critical Thinking
- Understanding
- Appreciation
- Creativity
- Practical Judgment
- Kinesthetic Developmental
- Personality Factors

V.7: Types of Human Development Codes

- Civic
- Vocational
- Existential

V.2: Source Codes

Return to Table of Contents

Return to Code List

The Source Code identifies the source of the content of any given excerpt. Does the excerpt capture a statement generated by the organization, a facilitator/teacher, a student/participant, an observer, a bridger, or an unknown party? Identifying the source of each excerpt positions HULA to compare the organization's aspirations with the facilitator's implementation and the student/participants' response to participation.

Note: This is an emergent code category. The HULA team developed the Source Code in order to capture the multiplicity of perspectives evident in the People and Stories/Gente y Cuentos (P&S) archive. This code did not yet exist during our work on the Illinois Humanities (IH) archive, and was not necessary for analyzing those materials as they were all produced by an organization that was seeking funding from the IH.

Parameters: Within each document, there may well be several different sources, or contributors. In rare cases, the source of a given excerpt may be unknown; and in some instances, one excerpt may have more than one source. For instance, while a newspaper article is a document produced by an Observer, it may include quotations from members of the Organization or Student-participants. When quotations are included, the appropriate code for the excerpt's source will capture the actual source of the words under consideration. A code from this category is to be applied to every excerpt, and more than one code from this category may be applied to any single excerpt. Paraphrased reports are attributed to the individual or entity doing the paraphrasing. The Student-Participant code should be used only when a student or participant is being quoted directly or is the author of the excerpted material (these may appear in evaluations or artifacts generated by student-participants such as writings or recorded demonstrations).

Teacher-Facilitator

The facilitator code captures content generated by or representative of the contributions or perspective of the facilitator. Facilitators are master humanists who directly lead or supervise the activities in which students or participants are engaged.

Example: *One of the older ladies said that it had awakened in her an interest to read more. Another participant said that he re-read the stories at home to his mother and then talked about them. He said that his mother was very impressed and wants to participate in the Project.* [From: Report-HispanicDevelopmentCorporation-Fall-2010]

Explanation: This excerpt is from a P&S facilitator's report and is solely in the facilitator's own words. While other perspectives are represented, they are paraphrased by the facilitator. As a result, only the facilitator code is to be applied.

Student-Participant

The student-participant code captures content generated by or representative of the contributions or perspectives of students or participants.

Example: *Initially the men felt that M. Loisel was "a good husband" but as we dugged deeper, we recognized his role in their totally unavoidable crisis. Myron said, "He's the one that tells her to go to her friends to get jewelry." Wilton added, "Yeah, he was trying to get her to buy flowers for her hair."* [From: Report-BoRobinsonMen-11-2010].

Explanation: The facilitator both paraphrases and quotes student-participant contributions to the discussion. Because the student-participants are quoted directly, the student-participant code should be applied along with the facilitator code.

Bridger

The bridger code captures content generated by or representative of the contributions or perspectives of bridgers. Bridgers are program participants who are not enrolled or engaged as student-participants, but whose involvement opens opportunities for bonding across sociological boundaries (race, class, experience, geographic, etc.)

Example: *Most agreed that no matter how hard the young man works, he will not be able to stop himself from going through the process of grief. Grief for the person he once was. Judy said, "Don't you think that he's probably just in a stage like grief, we don't know how long ago his injury was, so he's probably still in shock."* [From: Report-BoRobinsonMen-11-2010].

Explanation: In this excerpt, the facilitator quotes the contribution that Judy made to the discussion. Because we are told at beginning of the session report that Judy is a Crossing Borders member – that is, a community member who is joining the program sessions and who is neither the facilitator nor a student-participant -- the Bridger code should be applied in addition to the facilitator code.

Organization

The organization code captures content generated by or representative of the contributions or perspectives of organization. The organization is the wider institutional structure by which the goals, methods, mechanisms, and assessment methods are formulated and deployed. The organization often tends to the logistical details of a project, including funding provisions, grant applications, program schedules, material supplies, or venue arrangements.

Organization *code continued:*

Example: *Using literature as the currency for conversational exchange, participants come to recognize the universality of the human experience; and, they discover a deep satisfaction in discussing and appreciating works by authors such as James Joyce, Zora Neale Hurston, Bernard Malamud, Louise Erdrich, Alice Walker and Junot Diaz.* [From: Brochure-P&S-CBFlyer-Fall-2012].

Explanation: This excerpt is taken from a brochure advertising the opportunity for community members to participate in People and Stories/Gentes y Cuentos as a Crossing Borders participant. Because it is taken from a brochure, this excerpt is produced by the organization, P&S.

Observer

The observer code captures content generated by or representative of the contributions or perspectives of a third-party observer. An observer is a third-party witness to a project's advancement, such as a reporter, consultant, or a grant agency.

Example: *The survey results suggests that People and Stories would benefit from the following:*

1. *Fine tune specific objectives to correlate goals more intensively with 21st Century knowledge needs. This may include modifying or supplementing the discussion protocols so that SCANS skill development can become more intentional.*

2. *Routinely collect and interpret self-reports to determine program outcomes. This may include developing exit interviews, continued administration of a survey, or focus and face-to-face interviews.*

3. *Provide resources for a longitudinal study. This may include following program participants' education and work history over the course of time to determine the extended effect of this program.* [From: Assessment-LewandowskiReport-03-2000.rtf]

Observer *code continued:*

Explanation: This excerpt is taken from an evaluation of a P&S program series by a source external to P&S and therefore should take only the observer code.

Unknown

The unknown code is reserved for rare instances in which there is not enough information to determine if the source is an observer, bridger, student-participant, facilitator, or the organization.

Example: *Unlike other times when reading this story with a group of men, today's group generally did not demonize Aanakwad for her infidelity, rather Juan noted, "There's an untold story here. We don't know why she was unhappy with her husband; there's probably something he wasn't giving her that she needed."* (Report-BoRobinsonMen-01-2010).

Explanation: At the outset of this session report, the facilitator notes that there are 3 Crossing Border participants joining the group of men at Bo Robinson for the program. We are not told their names or given other ways to identify them. Consequently, we do not know how to categorize Jaun's contribution as quoted by the facilitator.

V.3: Craft Logic Codes

Return to Table of Contents

Return to Code List

Craft logic codes consist of: Goal, Method, Mechanism and Assessment Method. Every craft has a logic consisting of **goals, methods,** and the **mechanisms,** or causal relations that account for why its methods work, as well as tools for **assessing** or evaluating the success of any given example of the practice.

For each excerpt, the Craft Logic code captures which element of craft is being described in that excerpt by the organization or observers, described or practiced by the facilitator or teacher, or described or experienced by students or participants. The craft logic that HULA seeks to explicate is that of the facilitator or organization. That craft of the professional humanist is oriented towards the capacities, experiences, and types of development in students or participants. The code structure captures a real dynamic in the relationship between what we are referring to as “master” or “professional” humanists and “student” or “participants.”

General Parameters: Only one Craft Logic code may be applied per excerpt. In the case that an excerpt contains information relevant to more than one craft logic code, please re-excerpt (in full or in part) the passage and code accordingly.

Note: Double or triple excerpting may be required more often in “hybrid” document categories, e.g. documents that intermingle instructor reports with participant evaluations, or instructor reports paired with student writings.

Goal

An aspiration or desired outcome for the work being done; this is the strategic endpoint being aimed at.

Parameters: Goals can be short-term, mid-range, or long-term outcomes towards which the program aims, either explicitly or implicitly.

Example 1 (short-term, mid-range, and long-term): *Mrs. Hirschman said the program's main goal is introducing disadvantaged people to literature and showing them how it reflects their lives. But it also develops critical thinking skills, self-esteem and respect for cultural and economic differences, she said.* [From: Newspaper Story-Multiple-NA]

Explanation 1: This excerpt is a multi-fold goal statement. First, Mrs. Hirschman (the founder of P&S) states the program's main goal, even using the term "goal": "introducing disadvantaged people to literature and show them how it connects to their lives." Second, she lists several outcomes of the program that focus on the participants' development of certain capacities and traits: critical thinking skills, self-esteem, and respect for cultural and economic differences. While she does not explicitly apply goal-language to this list, these areas of development are also outcomes towards which P&S aspires and so also qualify the excerpt as a goal statement.

Example 2 (long-term and mid-range): *The program also widens horizons and creates new perspectives, leading to growth and change.* (Sheena-PressRelease-P&S-NA-NA.docx)

Explanation 2: This excerpt is a two-fold goal statement. First, the program claims to "widen horizons" and to lead to "growth and change," both of which imply the aim for future, or long-term, outcomes. Second, the excerpt identifies the development of "new perspectives," which suggests a more immediate, or mid-range goal.

Goal *code continued:*

Example 3 (short-term and mid-range): *I only wish I could get some of the other adults in the room to read aloud. I know they hold back for the sake of the boys being heard, but I want the boys to be able to listen carefully to what others have to say. Especially those they may consider very different from themselves, because that is when you see how very alike we all are.* (Report-LancasterCountyLibrary-06-2009.rtf)

Explanation 3: This excerpt captures the facilitator's immediate goals of "getting the other adults to read aloud" and for the "boys to be able to listen carefully," as well as the implied mid-range, or developmental, goal that they may come to see "how very alike we all are."

Method

This code is used for any activity carried out in order to achieve the goal of the craft project. Methods are the ***tactics*** used to achieve the ***strategic*** ends.

Parameters: As with the goal code, humanists don't necessarily write with these codes in mind and may, therefore, sometimes use more goal oriented language when describing a method or more method oriented language when actually talking about a goal. Coders should use codes to capture the craftsman's intentions, not just the explicit goal/method language they may or may not be using in any given statement. For example, beware of formulations like: "Mrs. Hirschman is hoping to expand the program to reach more teen-agers, substance abusers, parents who lack basic literacy skills and women who are making the transition from welfare to work" (Sheena-NewspaperStory-Multiple-NA.docx). While formulations like "is hoping to" may seem to warrant interpretation as a goal statement, the excerpt focuses on the organization's method for expanding participation from targeted populations; coding needs to reflect this.[Sheena-TrainingDoc-P&S-GuidelinesForCoordinators NEH-NA.rtf]

Method *code continued:*

Example 1: *We also discussed the characters contact and the confrontation, the dynamics between people who confront and those who are confronted. We talked about the motivation for this encounter and discuss the character's loneliness.* (SK_NT9-BurdenCarterCenter Nuance.docx)

Explanation 1: In this excerpt, the facilitator describes using discussion of text for the engagement of advanced literacy skills.

Example 2: *We introduced ourselves.* (SK_NT9-BurdenCarterCenter Nuance.docx)

Explanation 2: This excerpt presents a simple method of managing group dynamics.

Example 3: *Re-read passages, including and especially when questions are linked to those passages.* (sk-TrainingDoc-P&S-NA.rtf)

Explanation 3: This is excerpted from materials designed to train facilitators to make best use of the texts and to create connections between the text and questions from individuals in the program.

Mechanism

This code is used for excerpts that describe or implicitly capture the mechanisms that account for why the methods being deployed are expected to work. This code captures answers to the following question: What dynamics, or cause-effect relationships, inside the audience or student or embedded in the experience of the audience or student explain why a given method or tactic is expected to bring about the stated goal? Most often these dynamics will be "learning mechanisms" but there are other kinds of mechanisms too, for instance, "enjoyment" or "pleasure" mechanisms, cause-effect relationships that bring about enjoyment or pleasure in the audience.

Mechanism *code continued:*

Parameters: When coding, keep in mind that when you see a mechanism, it should also be conceptually linked to a method, but the reverse is not true. People often describe their methods without explaining why they expect them to work; only the latter type of explanation is an identification of a mechanism. If you code an excerpt as a mechanism, do not double excerpt to code as a method. Excerpts that (either implicitly or explicitly) indicate why an activity would work should be coded as mechanism.

Note: Unlike method-only statements, mechanism statements contain not just a "how" or "what," but also a "why." In most document types, there should be an explicit "X, therefore Y" causal logic used. In some document types, however, such as grant proposals, the causal content may be more subtle. Mechanisms may describe the functioning of a tactic related to a specific method, a sub-goal, or the overall goal.

Example 1: *This does not mean every story has a transforming effect. There are class clowns who crack jokes at the characters' expense. There are daydreamers who stare at the floor and mumble when questioned. But for the most part, the group members listen intently while a story is read, then jump into discussion. Their comments are often as funny and they are thoughtful. But in the end – and this is the key to the program's success, Mrs. Hirschman says – the discussion inevitably turns to the participant's own lives, taking on the air of a group therapy session.* [From: NewspaperStory-Multiple-NA]

Explanation 1: While much of this excerpt includes method-oriented language, the phrase "and this is key to the program's success" sets this apart as a mechanism excerpt because it provides insight into why the program's methods are believed to accomplish the program's goals: P&S succeeds, the organization argues, because "the discussion inevitably turns to the participant's own lives, taking on the air of a group therapy session."

Mechanism *code continued:*

Example 2: *This story evoked a lot of compassion. Several participants told of floods and storms they had experienced. One said once in Honduras the flood waters were waist-high. I asked about the contrast between the "cold" rain "burning" the crops that were drying, and many reiterated the use of "burning" for that kind of destruction. I reread the passage about the sound of the rain on the roof, and many commented on the sound of rain on zinc roofs in Latin America, and how the rain doesn't sound the same on the kinds of roofs we have in the US.* [From: Report-AdultLearningCenter-GyC-10-2010]

Explanation 2: Because the mechanism code should capture the cause-and-effect relationship that constitutes a given mechanism, this entire passage is excerpted in order to capture the mechanism at work. We are first told that "the story evoked a lot of compassion," and then we are given insight into how the story provoked participants to reflect on their own life experiences and memories in connection to the story. The evocation of compassion is the effect. The rest of the detail in the excerpt provides the cause.

Example 3: *Talk about one of your favorite stories. Why did you like it? "Eleven" because I was that little girl.* [(Chris-Report&Eval-ArchitectsHousing-03-2011.docx, question #17]

Explanation 3: This is a prompt paired with a response in which the student-participant describes a projected empathetic relationship onto the character in the story as the cause of his/her appreciation of the story. That psychological relationship of projected empathy is a mechanism for achieving appreciation.

Assessment Method

Any practice described as being used to assess the outcomes of the humanistic practice under the study.

Parameters: Assessments may involve explicit and formal evaluation processes either internal or external to the project, personal reflections (either formal or informal) of the humanists or participants, such as reports, questionnaires and surveys, as well as quantitative analysis or quantitative representation of the any of the above. Some types of assessment are built into basic humanistic practice, as with grading and commenting on student writing. Assessments may be formative evaluations, process/implementation evaluations, or summative evaluations.

Example 1: Informal Assessment: *My friends in academia said it would never work," Mrs. Hirschman said last week. "They thought it was crazy to expect people who had never read anything before to read high literature.* [From: NewspaperStory-Multiple-NA]

Explanation 1: Mrs. Hirschman reiterates how her friends evaluated the project and its methods prior to its inception. While this is not an assessment carried out by the organization or facilitators, it is an indirect and informal assessment of the viability of the program.

Example 2: Formal Assessment: *In addition, People and Stories fills a need for growth of personal meaning making.* [From: Assessment-LewandowskiReport-03-2000.rtf]

Explanation 2: This excerpt is from a report created by an outside consultant group to collect and analyze quantitative and qualitative data about the P&S programs for evaluation. The judgment expressed in this quote is a result of that QDA.

Assessment Method *code continued:*

Example 3: Informal Assessment: *The men expressed strong enthusiasm for the next class.* [Report-BoRobinsonMen-01-2010.rtf].

Explanation 3: In this excerpt from the "concluding remarks" prompt on a P&S session report, the facilitator's observation that the participants expressed an "enthusiasm" to return implies an assessment about the session's appeal to them.

V.4: Perceptual Domains Engaged Codes

Return to Table of Contents

Return to Code List

Perceptual domains consist of Verbal, Visual, Aural (musical, anything auditory that's not verbal), Behavioral (modeling), Kinesthetic, and Memory codes. This code family should be used to identify, for any given excerpt, which Perceptual Domains are being engaged by the method or mechanism. The code options identify the mode of intake by students, participants, or audience members of material, which will then be processed by their cognitive, affective, and/or intersubjective psychological capacities. To use this code, Coders are asked to answer the following question: What perceptual domains are described as being engaged (for descriptive excerpts) or are in fact engaged in this excerpt (for embodied excerpts)?

Parameters: Unlike Craft Logic codes, more than one Perceptual Domain code may be applied to each excerpt (for instance, anything involving films would be coded as both verbal and visual).

Verbal

Used for any goal, method or mechanism that depends prominently on the intake of language by the audience, participant, or student.

Example 1: (goal) - *Its main objective is to awaken interest in literature, but the program also widens horizons and creates new perspectives, leading to growth and change. It also helps people to appreciate the value of their ideas and provides a model for reading in the family.* [(Sheena-PressRelease-P&S-NA-NA.docx] Multiple-NA]

Explanation 1: The goal described in this excerpt depends on the engagement of verbal capacities, that is, "a model for reading."

Example 2: (method-creative) - *Adichie's story is an example of a writing style called "direct address"- which is where you speak directly to someone in your writing. The "someone" you are speaking to is implied with the use of the pronoun "you". For example, she begins her story... "You thought everybody in America had a car and a gun;..". She continues throughout the whole story as if speaking to a specific person, perhaps someone she has had unfinished business. Write a paragraph(s) or a poem that is written in direct address. Start with "You..." and write it to someone with whom you have unfinished business.* [Sheena-WritingPrompt-P&S-TheThingAroundYourNeck.rtf]

Explanation 2: This writing prompt identifies the narrative and linguistic style of the story and invites the participants to engage those styles by writing a story about someone in the participant's life. It is a method used to advance the program goal of connecting lives and literature.

Verbal *code continued:*

Example 3: (mechanism) - *Still, there were stories ("Marriage Is a Private Affair" was one of these) that sparked rich moments of discussion, and a few times when a core group of YEP students were enthusiastically engaged with the story, talking to each other and referring to the text.* [sk-Report&Eval-CabriniCollege-01-09 copy.docx]

Explanation 3: In this excerpt, participants take in language through the reading of the story and discussion surrounding it. The excerpt captures a mechanism insofar as we are told that "the story sparked rich moments of discussion" and we are given insight into the effects of this cause ("students were enthusiastically engaged with the story, talking to each other and referring to the text."). This is an instance of an enjoyment, or pleasure mechanism, where one of the notable effects is participant enjoyment of the program materials and/or activity.

Visual

Used for any goal, method, or mechanism that depends prominently on the intake of images or other visual stimuli by the audience, participant, or student.

Example 1: (goal) - *The project results in three sets of 200 archival, museum quality portraits designed to exemplify the root population of County.* [from: 12GF_19811015_6031.rtf]

Explanation 1: The visual goal is indicated by the project's "results" of producing portraits.

Visual *code continued:*

Example 2: (method) - *Invite brainstorming about the title: What impressions, associations, ideas and images are evoked by "The Thing Around Your Neck"? What do you think this story might be about?* [Sheena-StudyGuide-P&S-TheThingAroundYourNeck]

Explanation 2: That directive to "invite" the participants includes the prompting for "images," indicates it is a method that aims to involve visual capacities.

Example 3: (mechanism) - *First, though, I asked if anyone had seen or touched an abalone shell. "They're about the size of a cake plate," Mary said holding up her hands, "and on one size they are crusty and bumpy, but on the other they are smooth. It makes you think of the bumps you had in life." Even before reading the story, the abalone shell became a metaphor. "Why do you think Toshio Mori repeated the word three times in the title?" I asked when I'd finished. "Because each one is different," one woman said. "And they're all beautiful." "Does that remind you of anything else?" I asked, and Mildred said, "People. How they're all different, and you have to get to know them to find out what they're like." That, a few others said, "takes a lot of listening. Sometimes you just have to sit with them and spend time."*

Explanation 3: In this excerpt that was coded "conversational mechanism," the visual image of the abalone, serves as a medium for motivating the progress of the conversation. The discussion of the image of the abalone in the first several sentences facilitates the following discussion of the abalone in the literary text.

Aural *(musical; non-linguistic auditory)*

Used for any goal, method, or mechanism that depends prominently on the intake of non- linguistic sound by the audience, participant or student.

Aural *code continued:*

Example 1: (goal) - *"The purpose of the museum is to explore rich and vibrant history of gospel music in Chicago through interactive exhibitions, displays and educational programs. The exhibits and programs will demonstrate how the music developed in the sanctified churches, was introduced into mainline Protestant churches and eventually broadcast on radio, featured on recordings and presented in secular or public venues"* [from: 92GF_20110309_4786.rtf]

Explanation 1: In this excerpt, because the exhibit is exclusively about music and music history and is described as "interactive," we can safely assume that music (which is comprised of non-linguistic sounds) will be heard by the attendants.

Example 2: (method) - *If you'd like to make the last class a "party" with food and music after the short story reading / discussion and distribution of certificates and books, feel free to do so.* [Sheena-TrainingDoc-P&S-GuidelinesForCoordinators NEH-NA.rtf]

Explanation 2: In this excerpt, the last session will be a party with "music."

Example 3: (mechanism) - *The Lake Forest Symphony Association and Lake Forest College plan to cooperate in a series of public programs that will place the musical performances of the Symphony in a broad cultural perspective. These programs will demonstrate ways in which humanist professionals can enrich an audience's appreciation of an artistic performance by placing it in its original context.* [from 09GF_19811015_6027]

Explanation 3: This excerpt from a grant proposal explicitly describes how the humanistic methods can aid in the intake of non-linguistic sound.

Behavioral Modeling

Used for any goal, method, or mechanism that depends prominently on the observation of behavior or human action by the audience, participant or student.

Example 1: (goal) - *With the addition of Suzanne Oliver to the company, PLUS ONE, • • has broadened its pedagogical inclination still further. Through her knowledge of human anatomy and her penchant for various forms of alignment therapy, Suzanne has been influential in determining greater emphasis in workshops and residencies upon the development and maintenance of healthy, self-aware bodies. Thus we feel that we succeed in presenting both intellectual and physical aspects of dance, which, ideally, serve to inspire a continued interest in the art forms.* [from: 20GF_19811215_6038]

Explanation 1: This excerpt captures the organization's desire to use the demonstration of physical activity in its programs to achieve its goal of "sustaining interest in the art forms." Because the demonstration is the means by which the organizers anticipate that participants' interest will be sustained, this excerpt is also a mechanism.

Example 2: (method) - *At the Forum V Evanston site underwater archaeological methods and recovery will be demonstrated, on shore, by volunteer society divers prior to the forum presentations.* (31GF-19830515_6153.rtf)

Explanation 2: The method (underwater archaeological methods) in this excerpt involves "demonstration" which implies that program participants can model their behavior based on this experience.

Behavioral Modeling *code continued:*

Example 3: (mechanism) - *Gwendolyn Brooks, the author of over twenty-six books, a Pulitzer Prize winning poet, and the Illinois State Poet Laureate, will read her poetry for both conference participants and the general public. We were very fortunate to have her participate, for she best epitomizes the strength, creativity and achievement of Illinois women that this conference is designed to highlight. Units from across the campus have expressed interest in her presentation.* (37GF_19921101-11409.rtf)

Explanation 3: Human resources are often regarded as key success factors in IH proposals and this is a good example of human capital serving as a mechanism. The poet, Brooks, her achievements as well as her personal character, represents a role model to Illinois women worthy of emulation.

Kinesthetic

Used for any goal, method, or mechanism that relies on the use of physical activity, either active or passive, for the intake of higher-order information.

Example 1: (mechanism) - *If we try the foods; hold the clothing; feel how heavy the backpack was that they carried in the Revolutionary War or the Civil War; smell what the clothing smells like after it has been worn and been around campfires — those are the experiences that you remember, and that association will hopefully keep the actual lessons and the curriculum in the forefront of their minds, at least long enough to be valuable.*

Explanation 1: In this excerpt, the use of physical experiences specific to the historical period are anticipated to engage intimate association with that period, and then result in substantial learning.

Kinesthetic *code continued:*

Parameters: Note that the Kinesthetic code appears under both code families of Perceptual Domains Engaged and Psychological Capacities Deployed. Under the first, it should be limited to excerpts that capture the use of physicality for the **reception** of "higher-order" information (e.g. positioning students' desks in a classroom to help the students understand via that physical experience the subtleties of different relations of power) . Under the second it should be limited to excerpts that capture the use of physicality to **demonstrate** or **express** "higher-order" information (e.g. Alvin Ailey Dance Company performing "Revelations" as an expression and demonstration of grief and joy).

Memory

Memory is an input that makes material available for processing with other psychological capacities. It can be double coded alongside any of the other perceptual categories.

Example 1: (method) - *I asked a closing question, "Who never washed their hands of you?" and Ann talked about her father. "I had some sins. I was a tomboy. But he never condemned me. He was always there for me. And today, I pray every day that he knows how much I love him.* [Report-CamdenSeniorDayCenter10-2011.rtf]

Explanation 1: This excerpt from P&S describes the use of a question that triggers the participant's memory in order to connect her previous life experience to an element in the literature being shared.

Memory *code continued:*

Example 2: (mechanism - conversational arc) - *"The subtle discretion got us talking about how we decide what to reveal and what to conceal when it comes to sensitive areas in our life. How often we tell one version of the story to one person, and another, slightly revised version of the story to another."* [ReportBoRobinsonMen-01-2010.rtf]

Explanation 2: This excerpt from P&S shows us how the conversation between participants about the story being discussed was moved from an isolated moment in that story to invocations of participants' personal recollections and revelations about how they chose to tell stories of their own pasts.

Parameters: Although the use of recollection and the deployment of the faculty of remembering might be explicit in both prompts and responses, the Memory code should be reserved for cases where what is remembered has occurred outside the program.

V.5: Psychological Capacities Deployed Codes

Return to Table of Contents

Return to Code List

The Psychological Capacities Deployed code captures the psychological capacities used by student-participants to process the material presented to them via the activity guided by the master humanist. Every experience taken in through our multiple avenues of perception is then processed by our cognitive, intersubjective, affective, or kinesthetic capacities. To use this code, coders ask: "What psychological capacities are described as being deployed (for descriptive excerpts) or are in fact being deployed in this excerpt (for embodied excerpts)?" The possible answers are: Cognitive-Analytical, Cognitive-Imaginative, Cognitive-Undetermined, Metacognitive, Affective, Intersubjective, and Kinesthetic.

Parameters: Unlike Craft Logic, more than one Psychological Capacity Deployed code may be applied to each excerpt (for instance, a project on visual art interpretation may involve both Cognitive-Analytical and Cognitive-Imaginative capacities).

Cognitive-Analytical

Thinking and reasoning depend on linguistic, mathematical, and visual-spatial capacities to transform representations (e.g. perceptions and memories) via inference, induction, deduction, analogy, identification of similarities and differences, categorization, and the manipulation of concepts.

Example 1: (mechanism) - *"Musicians will be actively involved in the post rehearsal discussions, making available to members of the audience their observations on both the music and the humanists' explanation of the context."* [09GF_19811015_627,rtf]

Explanation 1: The document from which this excerpt is taken provides the contextual information that the discussions are conducted by "musicians," who will be preparing a piece of music for performance and other types of humanists who will draw on their own fields to contextualize the musical piece. The excerpt suggests that the craftsmen seek to engage audience members in their experience of the performance through an "explanation of the context," that involves, among other things, identifying similarities and differences, categorizing, and manipulating concepts.

Example 2: (method) - *"Using slides, Professor Mitchell will help the audience focus upon the great artistic achievement of the period in art as well as music, showing the parallels and contrasts in the two art forms."* [09GF_19811015_627,rtf]

Explanation 2: The kind of cognitive work that Professor Mitchell will invite the audience to engage in -- "using slides" and "showing the parallels and contrasts in the two art forms"-- reflects the deployment of both cognitive-analytical capacities and cognitive-imaginative capacities, so both codes should be applied.

Cognitive-Analytical *code continued:*

Example 3: (assessment method) - *"We intend to ask the participating humanists and musicians to write short statements telling us of their reaction to the programs and soliciting suggestions for how programs of this nature might be handled in the future."* [09GF_19811015_627,rtf]

Explanation 3: The assessment deploys linguistic capacities and invites participants to analyze their experience in the program and the program's future success.

Parameters: Any excerpt may have flavors of both analytical cognition and imaginative cognition (see below *Parameters*). The goal is to determine which flavor is stronger. When the two flavors are equally balanced, please apply both codes. If the cognitive work described could be done either analytically or imaginatively, please use the code Cognitive-Undetermined.

Note *(Caution)*: Projects that focus on expository prose should be coded as Cognitive-Analytical.

Cognitive-Imaginative

Imaginative or creative thought depends on linguistic, mathematical, and visual-spatial capacities to transform representations (e.g. perceptions and memories) in novel and non-obvious ways; this type of thinking may involve a greater degree of associative thinking, use of metaphor, lateral thinking, breaking of paradigms and rules, etc.

Cognitive-Imaginative *code continued:*

Example 1: (method) - *When I asked about the phrase, "a rainbow which men once symbolized," there was a moment of quiet, as they thought. "I don't think we are a rainbow," a woman finally said. "I think greed gets in our way."* [Report CamdenSeniorDayCenter10-2001.rtf]

Explanation 1: This excerpt reflects the analysis of and reflection on a visual symbol, the rainbow, and thus the deployment cognition grounded in imaginative capacities.

Example 2: (method) - *"Each week I distributed a biography of the author. The reverse side usually held a map of where that author was from or maybe a poem that was written by the author. We would have a short discussion about the author and the title of the story to be read before reading the story. These discussions were often very comical with the participants surmising what the story would be about".* [Report-ArtchitectsHousing-11-2007.rtf(1045-1428)]

Explanation 2: This excerpt reflects an equal balance of cognitive-analytical and cognitive-imaginative elements, and therefore should be coded as both.

Example 3: (goal) - *"With all of our films, the production of our documentaries supports, employs, and inspires significant numbers of local media artists."* [97GF_20120611_4920.rtf_9350-9484]

Explanation 3: This excerpt's emphasis is on films, and therefore images and the creative associations necessary to film-making, so this is to be coded Cognitive-Imaginative. While coders might surmise that documentaries involve the audience in some analytical work, the excerpt itself does not provide enough of the analytical "flavor" to warrant also coding it Cognitive-Analytical.

Cognitive-Imaginative *code continued:*

Example 4: (mechanism) - *By the end of the discussion the participants felt it was one of their favorites also. I was able to give the participants some first hand information on the author. This helped them to better understand why the story was told in scenes somewhat like a movie is shot.* [Report-ArchitectsHousin-11-2007.rtf]

Explanation 4: This excerpt is mechanistic insofar as providing students with information on the author helped students to understand the story better. This understanding includes comprehension of the story's use of movie-like imagery for telling the story. The association between the author's storytelling technique and the scenes of a movie indicate the deployment of cognitive-imaginative capacities, in addition to cognitive-analytical capacities.

Parameters: Any excerpt may have flavors of both analytical cognition (see above *Parameters*) and imaginative cognition. The goal is to determine which flavor is stronger. When the two flavors are equally balanced, please apply both codes. If the cognitive work described could be done either analytically or imaginatively, please use the code Cognitive-Undetermined.

Note *(Caution)*: Any project that involves images should be coded as cognitive-imaginative, in addition to whatever other psychological capacities it deploys. Some images will fall into both the analytical and imaginative categories, e.g. maps, blueprints, etc.

Cognitive-Undetermined

Some excerpts that are clearly cognitive rely on images or imagination; some that are clearly cognitive rely on analysis, and some rely on both imaginative and analytical capacities. Cognitive-Undetermined is used to mark cases that are clearly deploying cognitive activity, but where the cognitive activity is not described sufficiently to be

Cognitive-Undetermined *code continued:*

identified as either imaginative or analytical. For example, a facilitator might ask a question that calls for impressions of a passage in a text. Responses to that question could be either imaginative (e.g. use of an inventive metaphor) or analytic (parsing the meaning of a particular word as a tool to understand the meaning of the text). Therefore, the prompt is most appropriately coded as Cognitive-Undetermined.

Example: (method) - *"The story will likely lead to rich discussion about cultural assumptions, belonging, alienation and the meaning of the title. After reading "The Thing Around Your Neck," jot down your own questions, thoughts, confusions and impressions. What intrigues you about this story? What catches your attention? Make some notes on the story or in the space below."* [StudyGuide-TheThingAroundYourNeck]

Explanation: Taken from a Study Guide designed for facilitators to prepare for the discussion, this excerpt aims to deploy cognitive capacities. The prompt, however, does not give enough information for coders to judge whether the participant will deploy cognitive-analytical capacities, cognitive-imaginative capacities, or both in responding to the questions provided. In such a case, coders apply the Cognitive-Undetermined code to reflect the open-ended quality of this set of questions.

Meta-Cognitive

Meta-cognition can describe theoretical or strategic occurrences. The first involves thinking about thinking, and the second self-regulation of cognition. The term, "meta-cognitive," applies to thinking about one's own thought processes.

Meta-Cognitive *code continued:*

Example 1: (method) - *When the narrator watches Jeopardy, she roots (in this order) for women of color, black men, and white women. Do you find yourself favoring (or disdaining) people of a particular gender or race when you read about sports, politics, crime or other news?* [Sheena-StudyGuide-P&S-TheThingAroundYourNeck.rtf]

Explanation 1: The excerpt is taken from a Writing Prompt to which student-participants are invited to respond after reading and discussing Adichie's story, "The Thing Around Your Neck." The prompt asks the participant to think about her or his thinking in two ways. First, by asking, "Do you find yourself favoring (or disdaining) people of a particular gender or race when you read about sports, politics, crime or other news?" Second, by asking the participant to reflect on how the Adichie's unique narrative voice affects the participant's reading of the story.

Example 2: (mechanism) - *Why do you think Adichie wrote this story in the second-person (the "you" form)? How does that affect your reading of it?* [From: Sheena-StudyGuide-P&S-TheThingAroundYourNeck.rtf]

Explanation 2: The excerpt is taken from a Writing Prompt to which student-participants are invited to respond after reading and discussing Adichie's story, "The Thing Around Your Neck." The prompt asks the participant to think about thinking in two ways. First, by asking him/her to think about the author's own thinking process, and second by asking him/her to think about how that choice impacted his/her thinking about the story.

Example 3: (method) - *I also asked about the expression "torbellino" (whirlwind), and one said he feels that when he has lots of thoughts in his head at once; another said he tries to draw his thoughts far from prison.* [From: ReportGardenStateYouthCorrectionalFacility-10-2005.rtf]

Explanation 3: The excerpt is taken from a facilitator's report. Both responses to the facilitator's question capture the student-participants' reflections on their own thought processes.

Affective Domains

This code captures occasions when the practitioner's methods deploy, or are intended to deploy, the emotional and motivational make-up of the audience or student. The affective domain also captures intrapersonal personality traits, for instance, independence of judgment, self-confidence, attraction to complexity, aesthetic orientation, openness to experience, risk-taking.

Example 1: (mechanism) - *This project aims to combat teacher burnout and lack of faith in student capacity by involving students and teachers in a collaborative process of reform, developing written and audio history materials together with the senior citizens. Seeing and working with students involved at this level in the learning process can not fail to inspire teachers.* [53GF-19941010_11557.rtf]

Explanation 1: The excerpt, taken from a grant proposal, describes the desire to motivate, or "inspire" teachers via a method of involving multiple media and age groups in a shared focus. The focus on "combat[ting] teacher burnout and lack of faith in student capacity" indicates that the program deploys the emotional and motivational make-up of the participants. The desired result is inspiration of the teachers.

Example 2: (mechanism) - *The reason behind is that if literature in Spanish is deglamorized by using a popular genre such as film, the Latino layperson will be encouraged to participate in the appreciation of literary works.* [51GF_19940425_11506.rtf]

Explanation 2: This excerpt explains why the program expects its methods to stir appreciation in the target audience.

Affective Domains *code continued:*

Example 3: (goal) - *...provide both a role model for up and coming new filmmakers as well as a screen image and stories that women in the audience can relate to.* [13GF_19811015_6030.rtf]

Explanation 3: This excerpt expresses that both the goal and method of this project relate to the audience's need and motivation. A role model appeals to one's emotions and motivations by provoking admiration and providing a pathway by which one's aspirations might be pursued. The screen image and stories seek to be relatable, particularly to women in the audience, and so probably reflect identifiable intrapersonal traits and activate those same traits within audience members.

Intersubjective Domains

This code captures occasions when the practitioners' methods deploy, or are intended to deploy, the psychological orientation of the audience or student to other people. The intersubjective domain captures issues of attunement and/or mis-attunement as well as interpersonal personality traits, for instance empathy and perspectival flexibility.

Example 1: (method) - *After basic rapport and an atmosphere of sharing have been created and questions have been refined through group meetings, students and seniors will meet individually and in small groups to conduct a series of senior and student interviews.* [53GF-19941010_11557.rtf].

Explanation 1: Fostering an "atmosphere of sharing" and "conducting" a series of senior and student interviews" involve deploying the psychological orientations of participants toward others.

Intersubjective Domains *code continued:*

Example 2: (goal) - *The goals of the Colloquium are to provide a meeting ground for dialogue among the diverse per-pies (peoples) of New City, and together to explore cultural heritage and Identity as keys toward finding greater neighborhood stability.* [43GFN_19921120_11415.docx]

Explanation 2: This excerpt explains why the program expects its methods to stir appreciation in the target audience.

Example 3: (mechanism & goal) - *It is through researching their History Fair project that students involve the larger adult community in the learning process--both as resources to be and as learners in their own right. The History Fair brings together school and community not only for the obvious benefit of the students, but also for the benefit of parents, friends, librarians and the larger community whose interest in their shared past is piqued by an examination of their heritage.* [07GF_19810815_0625.rtf]

Explanation 3: This excerpt, though short, is particularly rich. Mechanistic language is used to describe how the program's success hinges on the interactions between students and the larger adult community. The goal is then identified -- to benefit not only individuals (students, parents) but also "the larger community." In this goal and the related mechanism, the organization emphasizes issues of interpersonal attunement and mis-attunement across generations and within a community.

General Parameters: All activities that involve the intersubjective domain also involve the affective domain, but not vice versa. Only excerpts that explicitly or self-consciously thematize the intersubjective element should be coded as both affective and intersubjective. Some projects or excerpts may involve intersubjective elements but do not self-consciously make use of them. For instance, some may involve person-to-person interaction without explicitly developing or enaging the psychological, emotional, and cognitive facets of interaction that constitute intersubjectivity. The code may be used to capture both the actual engagement of relationality (people interacting) as well as reflections about relationality (such as one might find when the humanist practitioner asks why certain fictional characters interacted as they did).

Kinesthetic

This code captures occasions when the practitioner uses physical capacities and skills in concert with higher-order intellectual or psychological expressions or demonstrations.

Example 1: (goal) - *The program will combine poetry, music, ballads and dance in an energetic performance which is the result of much combined experience and a history of working together to combine these various forms.* [GF19811015_6029.rtf]

Explanation 1: The program uses physical dance to convey the combined influences of the art forms.

Example 2: (method) - *Other segments of the program to be held on 12 November include the film Dances with Wolves, crafts demonstrations by elders from the American Indian Center's Senior citizens Program, pow-wow, and an Indian food booth. NASP has submitted an application to the Illinois Arts Council to provide funds for the crafts demonstrations and the pow-wow singers and dancers.* [33GF_19921101_11405.rtf]

Explanation 2: Because this project has both a demonstration of various physical activities and affords attendees the opportunity to participate in some of these activities (such as a pow-wow, a food both, and crafts demonstrations), it should be coded as kinesthetic.

Example 3: (mechanism) - *"Powerwalk" simulation described on the previous pages asks students to identify (perhaps emotionally as well as physically) with an assigned culture-piecing out its cultural patterns by stepping forward and back. Students had already cognitively learned about these cultural patterns, but the simulation forces students to face the consequences of a cultural pattern on a culture, on an individual, on how they might think, act, or...*

Kinesthetic *code continued:*

Example 3: (mechanism) *continued - ...be if they were members of that culture. The assignment to a culture and the physical movement back and forth, combined with my continual prompt to "look who is moving with you and who is not, who is on the same level as you and who is not," helps to reveal the consequences of these cultural patterns. The Powerwalk exercise helps students raise specific questions about "if this is true" or "why and how this has come to be" and "what else could be going on. [Citizenship Across the Curriculum (Scholarship of Teaching and Learning)* (Kindle Locations 696-759). Kindle Edition]

Explanation 3: This excerpt describes a very explicit use of movement and physical experience to reveal higher order understandings of social and political relations.

Parameters: Note that the kinesthetic code appears under both code families of Perceptual Domains Engaged and Psychological Capacities Deployed. Under the first, it should be limited to excerpts that capture the use of physicality for the **reception** of "higher-order" information (e.g. positioning students' desks in a classroom to help the students understand via that physical experience that subtleties of different relations of power) . Under the second it should be limited to excerpts that capture the use of physicality to **demonstrate** or **express** "higher-order" information (e.g. Alvin Ailey Dance Company showing "Revelations" as an expression and demonstration of grief and joy).

V.6: Types of Intellectual/Personality Development Codes

Return to Table of Contents

Return to Code List

This code family captures the capacities (intellectual and personal) that develop as a result of the engagement of student-participants in the activity being described or experienced. Cognitive, affective, intersubjective, and kinesthetic capacities work together to develop a range of kinds of intelligence. This code identifies the type of intelligence that each craft project seeks to cultivate.

Coders answer the question: 4) What types of intellectual or personality capacity are under development by the humanist in this excerpt, whether as a matter of description or embodiment? Possible answers are: Basic Literacy, Advanced Literacy, Communication Skills, Critical Thinking, Understanding, Appreciation, Creativity, Practical Judgment, and Personality Factors.

General Parameters: Excerpts may involve more than one type of Intellectual/Personality Development codes. An excerpt may have combinations of any of the codes in this family. Understanding, Appreciation, and Critical Thinking are the most closely affiliated, as are the Literacy and Communicative Skill codes. Coders should determine if there are certain flavors in the clusters that are stronger than the others. When the flavors of more than one code are equally balanced, please apply those codes. For one instance, if emotional engagement or development (specifically attribution of a positive value or enjoyment) is emphasized, code for Appreciation. If the intellectual engagement or cultivation emphasizes analysis or evaluation, code for Critical Thinking. If those are of equal value, code for both. For another instance, if speaking, writing or listening is emphasized over basic reading or textual interpretive skills, code for Communicative Skills. If however, both sets of developmental skills are of equal value, code for both.

Basic Literacy

This code should be applied to excerpts that highlight acquisition of basic language competence (grammar, spelling, vocabulary, punctuation, syntax), as captured in the *Common Core Language Arts Standards.*

Basic Literacy *code continued:*

Example 1: (goal) - *Past support from the Connelly Foundation has helped us improve the literacy skills of Adult Basic Education students, motivating them to pursue further educational and vocational goals.* [Chris-FunderDoc-P&S-08-2007_Connelly Foundation Cover Letter.rtf]

Explanation 1: This excerpt captures the Connelly Foundation's focus on improving literacy skills. There is not sufficient information here to warrant applying the Advanced Literacy code, so it should be coded as basic literacy.

Example 2: (method) - *Firstly, we went over Spanish words and translations, then Ramon read for us.* [Report-BoRobinsonMen-03-2011.rtf]

Explanation 2: This excerpt comes from a bilingual program in which stories are read first in the original Spanish and then in an English translation. The Basic Literacy code encompasses the review of vocabulary, as we see in this excerpt, whether that review is of a participant's first language or a language more recently acquired.

Example 3: (mechanism) - *Because the story was primarily written in Black southern dialect the group felt they had a hard time understanding some of what was being said. So, I read the story and interpreted the dialogue in words the women could understand.* [Report-ArchitectsHouseing-11-2007.rtf]

Explanation 3: HULA uses the Common Core English Language Standards as our basis for skill specification for basic literacy and the Common Core Reading Standards as our basis for skill specification for advanced literacy. In this excerpt, by interpreting the dialogue during the reading of the story, the facilitator models for the students how to expand their comprehension of English to encompass a dialect. This skill (to compare and contrast dialects within a language) is listed in the Common Core English Language Standards, grades 6 - 12 and therefore is advanced.

Basic Literacy *code continued:*

Note 1: Basic Literacy also may involve literal and basic translation from one language to another for the purposes of learning the new language.

Note 2: This excerpt is a good illustration of why memos are a critical component of our QDA process. A memo here could be the germ of a larger paper about HULA's methods for creating code definitions, or the coder's concern about the application of codes in this instance. The coding team initially disagreed about whether the excerpt should be coded as basic or as advanced literacy because coders had different understandings of what the developmental activity in the excerpt was. Was the learning a part of basic learning of a first language, or something more akin to second language learning? Reference to the Common Core standards guided the decision to code the excerpt as an example of Basic Literacy. The coding choice, however, is interesting because it invites questions of political and social orientations, applied linguistics interpretations, pedagogical strategy, researcher bias, coder disciplinary orientations, and the relevance of context.

Note 3: It should be noted that the mere reference to "dialect" in an excerpt does not automatically mean it should be coded as basic literacy; it is important to pay attention to the context and what it reveals about the humanist's or student-participant's level of engagement with the dialect. For instance, the following would be considered advanced literacy: 1) analyzing different habits of metaphor in two different dialects; and 2) comparing and contrasting scenes in which a character uses standardized English and uses a dialect.

Advanced Literacy

This code should be applied to excerpts that highlight acquisition of improved skill at reading and interpretation, including intertextual skills, or the capacity to set multiple "texts" in relation to each other or in relation to self or others. The relevant skills and capacities are captured in the *Common Core Reading Standards.*

Advanced Literacy *code continued:*

Note: The concept of "texts" can include oral discourse if the relevant language has occurred within a relatively formalized context (a courtroom, a radio broadcast, a rap performance).

Example 1: (goal) - *One of the major goals of our Brooklyn project is to introduce participants to the liberating power of literature, which, in turn will heighten their desire to improve their reading and speaking skills, whether that be in Spanish or English.* (FunderDoc-P&S-NA-2010-ProposalV4.rtf)

Explanation 1: This excerpt from a proposal captures the goal of using literature to achieve longer-term human developmental goals .

Example 2: (method) - *The last line of the story was discussed. The group agreed that there was a double meaning to the line. "He sure has done a lot of traveling." They agreed the man had traveled around the country, and that his new approach to life was a life changing journey for himself.* (Report-ArchitectsHousing-06-2009_2.rtf).

Explanation 2: This excerpt from a report captures a method of advancing literacy beyond basic reading comprehension via group discussion. Recognizing "a double meaning" indicates improved skill at reading and interpreting.

Example 3: (mechanism) - *The poetic text stimulates the imagination, encourages the participants to search for meaning, and brings out creativity in a context where group interaction disciplines the dialogue.* (Brochure-Multiple-1990s.rtf)

Explanation 3: This excerpt from a document created by the organization captures its commitment to having participants constrain their interpretations via the requirements of intergroup dialogue. In so doing, they perform an interpretation of the text that is informed by the demands of intersubjectivity.

Advanced Literacy *code continued:*

Parameters: Literacy Skills (basic and advanced) apply to the development of skills in the consumption of texts, such as vocabulary acquisition, narrative comprehension, use of literary devices such as metaphor, analogy, etc. Basic literacy focuses on the acquisition of the mechanics of linguistic comprehension; advanced literacy focuses on the manipulation, use, or interpretation of whole texts or the components of texts.

Communicative Skill

This code should be applied to excerpts that highlight acquisition of improved skill at writing, speaking, presenting, and listening, including preparing exhibits, slides, presentations, etc. The relevant skills and capacities are captured in the Common Core State Standards for Writing, Speaking, and Listening.

Example 1: (goal) - *The purpose of the enrichment effort is to work on research, communication and analytic skills, which are often lost in the rush to get through the chronology, etc.* [07GF_19810815_6025.rtf]

Explanation 1: This excerpt explicitly identifies developing communication as a goal.

Example 2: (method) - *Encourage one person speaking at a time.* [sk-TrainingDoc-P&S-NA.rtf]

Explanation 2: While this excerpt explicitly identifies the skill of speaking, its focus is on improving the listening skills of all participants.

Communicative Skill *code continued:*

Example 3: (mechanism) - *At the beginning of this program, there were some participants who held quite firmly to their beliefs and were rattled when challenged. I noticed however, a shift in the style of communicating by session 5. Demichre, who had begun the sessions barely audible and somewhat defensive, began making eye contact with people around the circle and positioning his viewpoints not in opposition to others, but in ways that showed that he was now able to consider new angles and ideas. He no longer had to be right but found that engaging in a democratic dialogue was more rewarding.* [sk-FunderDoc-BoRobinsonMen-ReportSampleforNEH-01-2010 copy.rtf]

Explanation 3: This excerpt describes the overall improvement of communicative skills among the group, particularly with respect to listening to perspectives that might challenge their beliefs. One participant's development is described in detail with respect to speaking, listening, increased effectiveness of "body language" such as eye contact, and an openness to dialogue.

Parameters: Communicative skills apply to the development and production of speaking, writing, or listening in contrast to Literacy Skills (basic and advanced), which apply to the development of skills in the consumption of texts.

Critical Thinking

Capacity to reason effectively, especially using analytical cognitive capacities. (See above for the definition of those.) Critical thinking is reactive, generative, and often evaluative.

Critical Thinking *code continued:*

Example 1: (goal) - *The presentation of literary works through film would help the Latino communities to identify, comprehend and even appreciate traditions, their history, and their culture.* [From: 30GF_19811215_6040rtf]

Explanation 1: The combination of "identify," "comprehend," and "appreciate" used in this excerpt suggests that the program's goal involves complex cognitive development involving reactive analysis.

Example 2: (method) - *They will also conduct a lecture/discussion prior to each night's screenings which will include a history, philosophy, and explanation of how the work presented is a reflection of social attitudes and behavior.* [GF_16030test(7431-7640]

Explanation 2: This excerpt describes the deployment of cognitive-analytical capacities in a lecture discussion. A presentation covering several areas of humanistic study (history, philosophy, film) seeks to generate connections between the art and social attitudes and behaviors. Thus, coders can presume that there is an effort to develop the critical capacity to recognize and evaluate such connections.

Example 3: (mechanism) - *As a humanities project, WORDS AND PAGES connects the social and cultural influence of the small press printer to specific moments in American history. It concerns the role of the free press in a democratic society, the impact of the printed word on American culture, and the re-examination of craft values in modern society.* [GF_19921101_11407]

Explanation 3: This excerpt describes the methods of a project that is deploying cognitive-analytical capacities for the purpose of making connections between an historical object (small press printer) and historical events with which the audience is already familiar. The activity of analyzing these connections and their consequences develops critical thinking capacities.

Critical Thinking *code continued:*

Parameters: Critical thinking may be generative, evaluative, or reactive, and is something one does or performs, in contrast to "understanding," which is something one develops or achieves. (See: *General Parameters*).

Understanding

A synthetic grasp of the material (using either or both cognitive-analytical and cognitive-imaginative capacities) on the basis of which students can perform their own pro-active mental acts with the material or going beyond the material. Understanding is something that one achieves and performs. (See: *General Parameters*).

Example 1: (goal) - *The Lake Forest Symphony Association and Lake Forest College plan to cooperate in a series of public programs that will place the musical performances of the Symphony in a broad cultural perspective.* [GF_19811015_6207]

Explanation 1: This goal statement from an IH grant proposal suggests that part of the program's goal is to connect music and culture to create possibilities for greater understanding of their relationship.

Example 2: (goal) - *The newly-created Illinois Art-Humanities Fund offers the opportunity to explore the possibility of integrating the arts and humanities in programs that will enrich the understanding of musical performances by the Lake Forest Symphony, the audience, the musicians and the participating humanist professionals.* [GF_19811015_6207]

Explanation 2: This goal statement explicitly identifies "understanding of musical performances" as a desired outcome of the program.

Understanding *code continued:*

Example 3: (method) - *At the intermission, a member of the dance troupe will speak about the performance and its relationship to Spanish culture.* [GF_19811015_6207]

Explanation 3: Though the term understanding is not used explicitly, the desired outcome is implicit in this statement of the program's method - having a member of the dance troupe speak to the audience is intended to facilitate the audience's understanding.

Appreciation

Appreciation consists not only to understanding the reasoning or creative work of another with regard to how it works or what it does, but also of taking pleasure in it or assigning positive value to it. (Appreciation is just one of the pro-active mental acts that student-participants can perform on the basis of understanding, but it is a common one.) (See: *General Parameters*).

Example 1: (mechanism) - *The presentation of literary works through film would help the Latino communities to identify, comprehend and even appreciate traditions, their history, and their culture. Mirror representations, realistic representations or even poetic representations of Latinos in film would help them to eradicate the already internalized stereotypes created by commercial films and television, and it would also help rebuild their dignity as complete human beings.* [From: 30GF_19811215_6040rtf]

Explanation 1: This excerpt explicitly identifies "appreciation" as a desired outcome of the program. The flavors of Critical Thinking, Understanding, and Appreciation are almost of equal strength here. The Critical Thinking "flavor" appears in the desire to "help the Latino communities to identify...

Appreciation *code continued:*

Explanation 1 *continued*: ...traditions, their history, and their culture" as well as in the "mirror representations...[that] would help them to eradicate the already internalized stereotypes." The analytical work necessary to note similarities in representations and to distinguish oneself from internalized stereotypes enhances one's critical thinking skills. The term "comprehend" and the phrase "dignity as complete human beings" indicates the "flavor" of understanding. This excerpt presents this sense of dignity as a synthetic grasp of the value of their traditions and the illegitimacy of internalized stereotypes.

Example 2: (method) - *Humanist professionals can enrich an audience's appreciation of an artistic performance by placing it in its original context.* [From: GF_19811015_6027]

Explanation 2: This excerpt explicitly identifies "appreciation" as a desired outcome. Though there is a reference to "placing the artistic performance in its original context," we are not given enough information to know what this involves. Appreciation is the strongest flavor in the excerpt. Unlike the previous example, the Understanding and Critical Thinking codes would not be applied.

Example 3: (method) - *There was a lot of laughter and recognition of a Luella in everyone's lives. D. and T. knew someone back home in the projects who seemed like Mrs. Jones.* [From: Report-GardenStateJunvenilePenitentiary-10-2011.rtf]

Explanation 3: In this excerpt from a P&S report, the mention of laughter and recognition indicates the development of pleasurable connection with and understanding of the character, Mrs. Jones.

Creativity

The ability to develop novel and non-obvious ideas, solutions, objects, practices, and expressive works. (See above: *General Parameters*).

Example 1: (goal) - *We are applying to the Illinois Humanities Council for a development grant to allow us to continue our research, and in collaboration with our humanist scholars, develop a concept and detailed treatment for the film.* [From: 35GF_19921101_1407]

Explanation 1: In this excerpt, the grant writers specify that their aim is to develop an expressive work, in this case, "a concept and detailed treatment for the film".

Example 2: (method) - *The photographs will be both documentary and artistic, based on the model supplied by August Sander in pre-World War II Germany and by numerous other photographers who have created images that are simultaneously of artistic and historic significance.* [From: GF_19811015_6031]

Explanation 2: Though working with a pre-existing model, the organization aims to develop novel objects -- "photographs that will be both documentary and artistic".

Example 3: (mechanism) - *The second purpose makes this project a public program in the arts and humanities, since it involves both disciplines and relates them in a unique and intimate way. The arts are involved in the performance of the staged readings, the humanities are involved in the discussion of the play's issues with the audience.* [From: GF_19811015_6308]

Explanation 3: Although the development of creativity is not made explicit in this excerpt, the author is implying that by relating the arts and humanities on the same topics, the audience will have an opportunity to make new associations and think about the subjects in a "unique and intimate" way. This intention to engage associative or lateral thinking, though implicit in this example, should be coded as creativity.

Practical Judgment

The ability to reason soundly in answer to the question, "What should be done?" Such reasoning may be either pragmatic/strategic or ethical.

Example 1: (method) - *This guide will serve as a means for those who have attended the programs to discover ways to continue their interest in poetry by using the public library. The guide will include descriptions of all formats available -print, record, cassette, etc. There will also be information about sources for learning to sell and publish poetry. Also, information on Chicago poets and poetry will be available in the guide with information on poetry groups, readings, bookstores and other sources.* [From: GF_19811015_6029]

Explanation 1: This program explicitly supplies information for answering questions about how Chicagoans can more effectively find literary resources.

Example 2: (method) - *ASP hopes to attract a sizable audience of Indians and non-Indians to the total program. On 12 November, Native American high-school and college students will be invited to a luncheon and a workshop on the transition to college. If funds permit, workshops on cultural, educational, political, social, and health issues will also be held for these students.* [From: GF_19830525_6152.rtf]

Explanation 2: This excerpt captures how student participants are being educated in areas of practical decision making.

Practical Judgment *code continued:*

Example 3: (method) - *We talked for a while about when you step in to help another and when you mind your own business. M. was trying to puzzle for himself when he would turn his head. If it was a neighbor or a kid at school, he wouldn't do anything. It would be different if it was a family member. R. talked about why people don't defend kids like Chin and what you risk if you do. No one felt Chin got what he deserved, but too few seemed like they would be willing to stop it.* [From: Report-LancasterCountyYouthIntervention-04-2006 - Session 2].

Explanation 3: This excerpt is an example of both ethical and strategic reasoning about what should be done in a certain kind of situation, i.e., when one witnesses violence between others. M. considers what his own actions would be, while R. analyzes the choices of the main character in the story under discussion. The group as a whole notes the disjuncture between how they feel about the character's judgment and their own willingness to carry out the course of action that they judge most appropriate. Each phrase of this excerpt exhibits a different moment in the group's reasoning in response to the question, "what should be done?"

Kinesthetic-Developmental

The use of physical activity in concert with the development and/or processing of higher-order capacities that involve personality factors, practical judgment, creativity, understanding, and communicative skills.

Example 1: (method) - *"Below, I share a class exercise I conducted with my students through which they experience firsthand the limits of culture and then begin to ask questions about the politics of culture and its insularity. "Okay, everyone: you have your card,"...*

Kinesthetic-Developmental *code continued:*

Example 1: (method) *continued -* **...** *I yell outside on the main campus lawn to thirty-two smiling faces. They nod and clap. I go on. "That card I gave you tells you what culture you come from, what national culture you represent for this simulation, as well as different attributes of your culture. I am going to read some attributes and characteristics and you will step forward or backward based on what your card says about your assigned culture for the simulation. Got it?* [From: Citizenship Across the Curriculum (Scholarship of Teaching and Learning) (Kindle Locations 696-759). Kindle Edition]

Explanation 1: In this excerpt, the instructor describes the use of physical positioning to deepen the students' understandings of the "politics of culture and its insularity."

Personality Factors

The exercise of psychological capacities also helps develop personality factors including but not limited to perseverance, self-esteem, self-confidence, self-expression, ambition and resilience, as well as other intra-personal traits, such as those often considered to belong to the virtues or character development.

Note 1: The Personalities Factors code description is open-ended. Many personality factors not mentioned as examples here may be relevant to humanistic practice. The code can and should be applied in contexts that go beyond the specific list of examples provided here.

Example 1: (method) - *We also talked a lot about physical abuse versus physical discipline. Most of the men, with the exception of L., believed in hitting or spanking children in order to discipline them. They were hit as children, and they felt they deserved it. They challenged me about how I would discipline my son if he did...*

Personality Factors *code continued:*

Example 1: (method) *continued - ...something really bad. I said I'd use logical consequences, but they didn't buy that.* [From: Report - Garden State Juvenile Penitentiary - 10 - 2011]

Explanation 1: This is one very long sentence, also, it overlooks a key element that warrents the code application. Suggestion: "In this report from the P&S archive, the facilitator captures participants' willingness to share their personal beliefs with one another , which alone is not sufficient for applying the personality factors code. The excerpt, however, also inclules the participants' openness about their experiences of physical discipline as children as well as their collective self-confidence to "challenge" the facilitator's practices and beliefs. For these reasons, the personal factors code should be applied."

Example 2: (method) - *As the group developed and trust grew, members of the group discussed their apprehensions about getting out of prison, in response to the short story The Home-Coming. They pondered how they would be received by the families and communities they were returning to. They discussed the things that have wounded them deeply during the reading of Mother Dear and Daddy. This included some pain-filled sharing about the traumas they've experienced while incarcerated. An intense discussion about domestic violence ensued around the story entitled The Day It Happened. The impact of societal values and stereotypes on their self-understanding and behavior was prominent in the discussion of the story, Girl. All in all the group members explored many issues pertinent to the 're-entry' process...issues related to past mistakes and their hopes for the future.* [From: Report-EssexCountyCollege-10-2008]

Personality Factors *code continued:*

Explanation 2: This excerpt recounts, in connection with other developmental processes and goals, the development and deployment of self-expression (intrapersonal development) via self-reflection and sharing of difficult personal experiences (interpersonal development), which, though prompted by the stories read, moved beyond self-to-text engagement and into direct self-to-self and self-to-other engagement outside of the context of the text.

Example 3: (assessment) - *I really enjoyed this session and felt that the group gained in 'well-being' life points after our 2 hours together.* [From: Report-BoRobinsonMen-11-2010.rtf]

Explanation 3: The improvement of "well-being" among participants of the group is a clear signal that Personality Factors have been developed. Though we are not given a specific scenario or a specific kind of development (such as self-confidence or resilience), this assessment of the impact of the session on participants can be assumed to involve a variety of inter- and intrapersonal traits.

Note: The development of "self-expression" may or may not also involve the development of more other-directed and formalized communicative skills. For instance, a non-verbal child may be taught to work through her emotional reaction to hearing a poem by making drawings in her journal that are not intended for an audience other than herself, but these drawings may help her to understand her experience of that poem; or student-participants may develop skills for sharing personal stories with each other in the context of developing other personality factors such as grit, or confidence, or other genres of human or intellectual development. This code should be used to capture instances of "self-expression" that relate to the basic ability to externalize one's thoughts or emotions either to oneself or to another, especially in difficult circumstances or contexts of vulnerability. This contrasts with the more explicitly other-directed and formalized skills associated with the Communicative Skills code (see Common Core Speaking and Listening Standards).

V.7: Types of Human Development Codes

Return to Table of Contents

Return to Code List

This code family captures the more distal capacities that develop as a result of the engagement of student-participants in the activity being described or experienced and that give shape to the longer-term arc of a life. Cognitive, affective, intersubjective, and kinesthetic capacities work together to develop a range of kinds of intelligence; these in turn combine to support the development of the civic, existential, or vocational arcs of a life. This code identifies the distal capacities cultivated by the humanistic practice under consideration.

Civic

This code should be used when the project, or element of the project, provides empowerment for positive participation in the collective life of a community, including generation of a sense of ownership over a common world that includes strangers.

Example 1: (goal) - *Our main target audience is Southern Illinois residents. Based on the 2005 and 2006 exhibits, visitors will represent a diverse population and range in age from families with young children, adults, and senior citizens. The majority of our visitors are regional, but the Apple Festival does attract individuals from across the country. At this time, 475 junior high school students have been scheduled to visit the April 1865 exhibit and listen to the Ellis presentation.* [From: Sheena4176-1]

Explanation 1: This excerpt from an IH grant proposal identifies that one of the goals of the program is bringing participants from diverse demographics together to share in the experience of the Apple Festival. In so doing, the program fosters a sense of ownership over a common world and provides a forum for positive participation in the collective life of a community.

Civic *code continued:*

Example 2: (goal) - *This project seeks to establish bridges between three groups: practicing artists, academic humanists and the general public. We are convinced that the academic world, artists, and the larger community need to establish bridges of understanding.* [From: GF_19811015_6027]

Explanation 2: This excerpt from an IH grant proposal identifies the program's goal of helping establish commonalities between groups often seen as disparate. The goal of establishing bridges implicitly acknowledges the existence of strangers within one's world and seeks to foster a sense of commonality among participants from three specific groups.

Example 3: (method) - *Local historians in communities such as Elmhurst the South Side in Chicago have volunteered to work in the schools with students interested in discovering more about their communities.* [From: GF_19811015_6027]

Explanation 3: In this excerpt, the organization seeks to facilitate relationships between "local historians" in specific communities and "students interested in discovering more about their communities." In this way, the program accomplishes its goal by creating the possibility for positive participation in the collective life of "Elmhurst the South Side in Chicago."

Vocational

This code is for projects, or elements of projects, that aim to provide preparation or empowerment for bread-winning work.

Vocational *code continued:*

Example 1: (mechanism) - *We believe that a more hands-on approach is necessary to effect change in the most devastated schools. This project aims to combat teacher burn-out and lack of faith in student capacity by involving students and teachers in a collaborative process of reform, developing written and audio history materials together with the senior citizens. Seeing and working with students involved at this level in the learning process cannot fail to inspire teachers.* [From: GF_19941010_11557]

Explanation 1: This excerpt from an IH grant emphasizes collaboration as a means to accomplishing the program's over-arching goals of empowering teachers and students. Teacher effectiveness and success depend on fruitful relationships with students, which this program seeks to develop. Through these relationships, the organization hopes to inspire teachers to face the challenges associated with their bread-winning work.

Example 2: (method) - *This project is concerned with a public conference to be held November 14, 1981 at Kankakee Community College by the Kankakee branch of the American Association of University Women. The focus of the conference is to be upon the impact of changing work patterns upon family life... In particular the conference will focus on the effect of work on family lifestyle when work and family act as competing institutions which set up contrary demands on individuals.* [From: 15GF-19811015]

Explanation 2: This excerpt from an IH grant indicates that the project will use a conference to help participants understand competitions between bread-winning activities and home-life.

Example 3: (goal) - *During the summer, participants, with up to 10 students full-time paid through the Mayor's office of Employment and Training, and WHA staff will work with teachers to pull together a manuscript for publication, including an interpretative introduction and conclusion.* [From: GF_19941010_11557]

Vocational *code continued:*

Explanation 3: In this excerpt, participants are offered the opportunity to gain work experience in assembling a manuscript for publication. In this way, the project both provides them with breadwinning work and develops skills that prepare them for future employment opportunities.

Existential

This code should be used when the project provides empowerment for success at creative self-expression and world-making; and for success at rewarding relationships in spaces of intimacy and leisure.

Example 1: (mechanism) - *More importantly, however, the youth will begin to see their lives and their struggles as part of something larger than themselves, and the seniors will have a forum that allows them to see their struggle live on. By building relationships between youth and their elders, this project will be rebuilding community life.* [From: GF_19941010_11557]

Explanation 1: This excerpt identifies how the program fosters rewarding relationships between youth and seniors in spaces of intimacy and leisure. This outcome is the anticipated result of "building relationships between youth and their elders," and the causal relation between such activity and its impact on the wider community makes this a mechanistic statement with both civic and existential aims.

Example 2: (mechanism) - *Mirror representations, realistic representations or even poetic representations of Latinos in film would help them to eradicate the already internalized stereotypes created by commercial films and television, and it would also help rebuild their dignity as complete human beings.* [From: GF_19940425_11506]

Existential *code continued:*

Explanation 2: This excerpt focuses on fostering positive self-understanding among Latinos through "representations of Latinos in film." In addition, the project demonstrates the value of creative self-expression in helping others "rebuild their dignity as complete human beings" and emphasizes a way that film can be a positive world-making endeavor.

Example 3: (method) - *This model has been developed in response to interest by senior citizens and the youth of Austin in trying to share their stories of community life, history, and struggle between generations that are increasingly alienated from one another in the community as a whole. Youth in this neighborhood often don't have friends, they have associates, and they often feel that they can't even turn to busy parents for advice. Seniors see relatives rarely and spend a lot of time remembering by themselves or with their peers. Often they face the struggle of growing old alone and the youth of this same community face the struggle of growing up alone.*

Much is lost in this alienation. Images of strength and memories of struggle are no longer shared, and seniors sometimes turn away from young people in fear, unable to understand the violence and despair of youth. Young people are less often exposed to the long histories of struggle of their community, which would help them put their own struggles into a broader context.

Because there is no forum within the community to share common histories of struggle, triumph, and setbacks, outside stories of deficiencies and passiveness shape the views West Side residents have of themselves and their neighbors. [From: GF_19941010_11557]

Existential *code continued:*

Explanation 3: Throughout this excerpt, there is the theme of developing skills for success at rewarding relationships in spaces of intimacy and leisure, whether through nurturing parent-child relationships, creating spaces in which trusting friendships might form, or building bridges between youth and seniors in the community so both groups might feel less alone in their struggles.

V.8: Document Type and Coding

Return to Table of Contents

General Parameters: Some codes within code families constitute a "cluster," that is, they bear close relations to each other and more than one may apply to an excerpt. Though we can apply more than one code from these code families, it is important for the codes to reflect what is thematized as accurately as possible. The prevailing coding rule in these instances is to look for which code is the strongest or most dominant "flavor" and to code for that one. The clusters for which that "flavor rule" especially applies are the following:

Affective, Intersubjective, and Cognitive in Psychological Capacities Deployed. Among these three, determine which code is most strongly represented in the excerpt. Remember: The Intersubjective code encompasses elements of the Affective code. Only apply both codes when both are explicitly thematized, that is, when they are equally prominent in the excerpt. Within the Cognitive "flavor," coders must determine which of the Cognitive options is/are strongest, Cognitive-Analytical, Cognitive -Imaginative, Cognitive-Undetermind, or Meta-Cognitive.

Literacy-advanced, Literacy-basic, and Communicative Skill in Types of Intellectual/Personality Development. When verbal skills play a significant role in an excerpt, determine if the engagement or development aimed for is primarily with consumption of text or production of a text, or speech directed other people. In the first case, code for literacy, in the second communicative skill.

Understanding, Appreciation, and Critical Thinking in Types of Intellectual/Personality Development. When the emphasis or theme of the excerpt is engagement or development, identify the strongest flavor by determining if the primary method, mechanism or goal is the participant's use or achievement of a synthetic grasp of the material (understanding), pleasure in understanding or experiencing the creative or intellectual reasoning of another's work (appreciation), or analysis of the material (critical thinking).

Part 6: Samples and Commentary

Part VI: Samples and Commentary

VI.1: Application of Descriptors to Sample Document

Return to Table of Contents

Descriptors capture data that is stable throughout an artifact. All four descriptor sets (each with multiple fields) should be applied to each artifact. As always, in the case where there is not an appropriate descriptor field listed, make note of that in a memo (*Creating Memos*) and alert the HULA research director.

Below is text from a flyer from the P&S archive, followed by the appropriate descriptors.

People and Stories/Gente y Cuentos

A non-profit based in Trenton, NJ that provides literature programs for underserved adult populations in Mercer County and beyond.

Volunteer Opportunity:

"Crossing Borders with Literature" Spring 2011 programs

In "Crossing Borders with Literature" we invite suburban participants to join our Trenton programs in order to bridge the municipal, socio-economic, racial and ethnic lines that can divide us. In each session, you'll hear an acclaimed short story read aloud by a trained coordinator and participate in a rich discussion.

Your life may never be the same again!

Please consider joining one of our spring literature programs:

1. Bo Robinson Assessment and Treatment Center- women

377 Enterprise Way. Trenton, NJ 08638 (A minimum security facility) 8 sessions.

Dates: March 7- March 30

Day/Time: Mon/Wed. 12:30-2pm

**men/women volunteers are welcome. Please commit to at least 5 sessions.*

2. Bo Robinson Assessment and Treatment Center- men

377 Enterprise Way. Trenton, NJ

(A minimum security facility) 10 sessions. Dates: April 25- May 25th

Day/Time: Mon/Wed. 9-11am

**men/women volunteers are welcome. Please commit to at least 5 sessions.*

3. Clinton House- (halfway house- men)

21 N. Clinton Ave. Trenton, NJ

Dates: March 7- March 30 (8 sessions)

Day/Time: Mon/Wed 10-11:30am

**men/women volunteers are welcome. Please commit to at least 5 sessions.*

4. Architects Housing (seniors)

215 E. Front St. Trenton, NJ

Dates: March 14- May 2 (8 sessions)

Day/Time: Mon. 10:30am-12pm

**men/women volunteers are welcome. Please commit to at least 5 sessions.*

5. Children's Home Society (Spanish speaking program)

635 S. Clinton Ave. Trenton, NJ

Dates: March 2- April 20

Day/Time: Wed. 5:30-7pm

**men/women volunteers are welcome. Please commit to at least 5 sessions.*

Descriptors: The following descriptors should be applied to this document:

Demographic Fields:

- SEO mixed
- Mixed ethnicity
- Unclear age
- Unclear size of student group
- Location: Trenton, NJ
- Accessibility: Free
- Date range: 03 - 05/2011

Activity Fields:

- Interactive: YES
- Other Public Program

Document Fields:

- Publicity
- Archival Source: People and Stories
- Data Type: Qualitative
- Embodied Document

Discipline Fields:

- Literature

Media Fields:

- Textual

VI.2: Application of Codes to Sample Excerpt

Return to Table of Contents

Although each excerpt may have only one craft logic code, many will have multiple codes for each of the other code families: Source code, perceptual domains engaged; psychological capacity deployed, types of intellectual/personality development, and types of human development. See example below.

Example: *They will learn how to develop questions, a methodology, an interdisciplinary approach which includes primary and secondary historical texts, literature, and sociological methods. They will gain skills in interviewing, basic writing, editing and historical research and interpretation.*

This excerpt should be coded with the following:

- Organization
- Method
- Verbal
- Cognitive-Analytical
- Cognitive-Undetermined
- Intersubjective
- Understanding
- Communicative Skill
- Vocational
- Civic

Sample reasoning behind applied codes:

- **Organization:** The summary of what students or participants will be learning and doing indicates that this excerpt is part of a document produced by the organization.

- **Method:** The explanation of what skills and what "approach" grounds the application of Method to this excerpt. The choice among craft logic codes (goal, method, mechanism) is often dictated by the holistic content of the document or media. For instance, in this case, although the final sentence of the excerpt could be read as a goal statement, the broader goal of the project in question (document IH 11557)

Sample reasoning behind applied codes: *continued*

- **Method** *continued*: is stated as this: *"The Westside Health Authority is seeking funding for a community intergenerational history project, which aims to record, interpret and share the life histories and struggles of west side residents."* Given this context, the above excerpt aligns more with strategic methods than with a goal because it is explaining the capacities or skills it will develop in order to reach the desired ends (which, as explained below, involves the intersubjective capacity code in this case and, developmentally, the vocational and civic codes).

- **Verbal:** The application of this code is grounded in prevalence of textual and verbal emphasis throughout the proposal.

- **Cognitive-Analytical:** The application of this code is driven by the emphasis on textual and verbal skill development and method, e.g., "texts, literature", and "skills in interviewing, basic writing, editing and historical research and interpretation."

- **Cognitive-Undetermined:** The application of this code in addition to the above is motivated by the mention of "interpretation" in this excerpt, which is a gesture to its prevalence throughout this project.

- **Intersubjective:** The application of this code is related to the application of the one above and is grounded in the project's aim to "record" and "interpret" by means of an "intergenerational" activity in order to "share," and that it has the development of the skills to achieve positive outcomes in those practices articulated in its method (see above, under the method category).

- **Understanding:** The desired outcomes are in large part "developmental," aiming at a synthetic grasp of "primary and secondary historical texts" in the form of questions, methods, and approaches that facilitate other proactive mental acts.

Sample reasoning behind applied codes: *continued*

- **Communicative Skill:** The Gaining skills in "interviewing" and "basic writing" are skills for communication in a formal environment.

- **Vocational:** The application of this code is grounded in the emphasis on skill acquisition as well as mentor/mentee relationships as part of the project's method. For instance: "By combining this expertise with the skills of high school humanities teachers and professional consultants from both the Chicago Metro History and Northwestern University, community residents will develop their research skills and write community history."

- **Civic:** Human development codes are applied to the excerpt and with regard to the artifact as a whole. The application of Civic to this excerpt is motivated by its mention of "historical" research, which we know from the whole of the artifact refers to the community's history (see above).

Part 7:
Analysis of Data

Part 7: Analysis of Data

VII.1: Introduction

Return to Table of Contents

HULA gathers, codes, and analyzes the work products (artifacts) of professional and master humanists- including grant proposals for public programs, program and lesson plans, examples of student work or event experience, teacher's comments on student work and participation, and so on. We use these archives of material as the basis for a five-pronged analytical strategy. We use the material (1) to identify humanistic folk learning theories; (2) to understand the elements of humanistic craft; (3) to identify developmental pathways pursued by humanists; (4) to identify the "mechanisms at work" along those developmental pathways and (5) to connect current assessment instruments to those developmental pathways. These five analytical tasks provide a framework for the construction of new assessment instruments that will help better satisfy the needs of humanist and those in non-humanities based sectors.

We explain the first four analytical steps and then discuss our construction of assessment instruments.

VII.2: Folk Learning Theories

Return to Table of Contents

We analyze our archives of humanistic artifacts in order to identify (1) proximate intellectual development goals and distal human development goals that humanists describe themselves as seeking; (2) the methods they believe permit them to achieve those goals; (3) their causal explanations for why these methods should work; and (4) the assessment practices they currently use to evaluate whether they are meeting their goals and whether their methods are fit for their stated purposes. This results in a map of the learning theories used by humanists. We identify these as "folk learning" theories because they have been developed as part of the craft practice of the humanists, rather than through cognitive science or psychology. This element of our work helps the leaders of humanities programs see what they are doing.

As an example, in the case of the work of Illinois Humanities Council grantees, we have identified the following six learning theories as being at work:

Major Learning Theories:

1. Cultivating Understanding through Analysis and the Verbal Arts for Civic Goals
2. Cultivating Understanding through Imaginative and Multi-media Engagement for Civic Goals
3. Cultivating Appreciation, by focusing on Motivation, for Civic Goals

Minor Learning Theories:

1. Cultivating Creativity through Imaginative engagement for Existential Goals
2. Cultivating Critical Thinking through Analysis and the Verbal Arts for Civic Goals
3. Cultivating Understanding through Analysis and Visual Engagement for Civic Goals

VII.3: Elements of Craft

Return to Table of Contents

The elements of the humanist's craft comprise goals, methods, causal explanations for why the methods should work, and assessment practices. We analyze these elements of craft for each program that we study. This analysis permits us to capture the expertise developed by humanists through the evolution of their practice over time.

This aspect of our analysis also permits us to report back to a program on the content of their goals, methods, causal explanations, and assessment practices, identifying strengths and weaknesses.

VII.4: Developmental Pathways

Return to Table of Contents

Once we have identified the learning theories employed by particular humanities programs and have studied their elements of craft, we are in a position to identify the developmental

pathways that they are employing. By developmental pathway, we refer to the series of causal connections that a humanist expects will lead to the outcomes for participants that are sought by the program.

For instance, we have identified a set of programs among Illinois Humanities Council grantees that focus on engaging participants in verbal arts and analytical work in order to cultivate "understanding" with the expectation that this "understanding" will help participants develop as civic actors. What developmental pathway can lead from understanding, achieved via engagement with the verbal arts and analytical work, to civic success? One developmental pathway that we have identified, for which there is support in the literature of social psychology, is as follows:

Experiences of Insight → Lower Need for Cognitive Closure (higher Need for Cognition) → More complex perceptions of group identity → Greater Sense of Community

More than one developmental pathway might support the movement from the achievement of understanding, through engagement with the verbal arts and analysis, to success as a civic actor.

By identifying a range of developmental pathways that might explain the success of the learning theory employed by a particular humanities program, we offer the leaders of humanities programs a framework for self-identifying the developmental pathway that best captures what they are trying to do.

VII.5: Mechanisms at Work

Return to Table of Contents

Each developmental pathway consists of a set of "mechanisms at work." A mechanism is a cause-effect relationship that explains why the application of a given method has its specific result. In order to understand the impacts of humanities programs on participants, one needs to identify the mechanisms that are understood to bring about those impacts. Identifying mechanisms and developmental pathways makes it possible to connect short-term outcomes to longer-term goals. For instance, if a program hopes to generate more effective civic actors or to contribute to social cohesion, one way of assessing its success, as per the

developmental pathway sketched above, might be to assess how well its programs produce insight for participants and reduce their need for cognitive closure.

In other words, humanities programs might conduct their assessment of their practices by identifying "leading indicators" that would be good evidence that their participants are indeed on the pathway toward the long-term goal that is at stake. This approach solves the problem that plagues humanities assessment, namely that the sought-after outcomes manifest themselves so long after the "intervention" (the course, or program, or lecture) that it is analytically nearly impossible to tie the outcomes back to the program and the late arriving data points can't be used to improve the program itself at the time of its administration and application.

The mechanisms we identify are psychologically validated constructs that can be assessed via survey questions. Consequently, organizations can build their assessment instruments on the basis of survey questions that the field of psychology has made available.

VII.6: From Analysis to Assessment Instruments

Return to Table of Contents

The above four analytical steps permit us to build innovative assessment instruments for public humanities programs. Rather than focusing on audience counts and organizational metrics, we focus on the actual content of programming and its effect on participants. Our framework gives the leaders of public humanities programs insight into the work they have done to date, as well as a structure for self-identifying the developmental pathway(s) their programs emphasize. On this basis, they can then select sets of survey questions to use with participants to assess how well they are meeting their targets with regard to the leading indicators that should confirm that they are making effective progress toward their long term goals.

APPENDIX A: CODE GLOSSARY

Appendix A: Code Glossary

Return to Table of Contents

A - Source

This code captures whether the excerpt has been produced by a "facilitator" leading the program, a "bridger" who is participating as a model for the student-participants, by a "student-participant," by a third-party observer, by the organization itself, or by an unknown party.

Facilitator: The facilitator code applies to content generated by or representative of the contributions or perspective of the facilitator.

Student-Participant: The student-participant code applies to content generated by or representative of the contributions or perspectives of students or participants.

Bridger: The bridger code applies to content generated by or representative of the contributions or perspectives of program participants who are not enrolled or engaged as student-participants.

Organization: The organization code applies to content generated by or representative of the contributions or perspectives of the wider institutional structure by which the goals, methods, mechanisms, and assessment methods are formulated and deployed.

Observer: The observer code applies to content generated by a third-party observer, for instance a journalist or an evaluator.

Unknown: The unknown code applies when it is not possible to ascertain who or what entity was the source for the content in the excerpt.

B - Craft logic

Every craft has a logic consisting of its goals, it methods, its understanding of the mechanisms that account for why its methods work, and its tools for assessing or evaluating the success of any given example of the practice.

Goal: An aspiration or desired outcome for the work being done; this is the strategic endpoint being aimed at.

Method: This code is used for any activity carried out in order to achieve the goal of the craft project. Methods are the tactics used to achieve the strategic end.

Mechanism *(Explicit or Implicit)***:** This code is used for statements that capture the mechanisms that account for why the methods being deployed are expected to work; what dynamics inside the audience or student or embedded in the experience of the audience or student explain why a given method or tactic is expected to bring about the stated goal? Most often these dynamics will be "learning mechanisms" but there are other kinds of mechanisms too, for instance, "enjoyment" or "pleasure" mechanisms, mechanisms that bring about enjoyment or pleasure in the audience.

Assessment: Any practice described as being used to assess the project under the study; relevant assessments may be formative evaluations, process/implementation evaluations, or summative evaluations.

C - Perceptual Domains Engaged

Perceptual domains being called upon by the method or mode of intake by student or audience of the experience, which will then be processed by their psychological capacities. Memory is treated here as an "input" making material available for processing by psychological capacities.

Visual: Used for any goal, method, or mechanism that depends prominently on the intake of images or other visual stimuli by the audience or student.

Behavioral *(Modeling)***:** Used for any goal, method, or mechanism that depends prominently on the observation of behavior or human action by the audience or student.

Aural *(Musical)***:** Used for any goal, method, or mechanism that depends prominently on the intake of non-linguistic sound by the audience or student.

C - Perceptual Domains Engaged *(continued)*

Verbal: Used for any goal, method, or mechanism that depends prominently on the intake of language by the audience or student.

Kinesthetic: Used for any goal, method, or mechanism that depends prominently on physical movement on the part of audience or student for their intake of the experience offered to them by the humanist craftsman.

Memory: Memory is an input that makes material available for processing with other psychological capacities. It can be double coded alongside any of the other perceptual categories.

D - Psychological Capacities Deployed

Every experience taken in through our multiple avenues of perception is then processed by our cognitive, affective, intersubjective, or kinesthetic capacities.

Cognitive Analytical: Thinking and reasoning depend on linguistic, mathematical, and visuo-spatial capacities to transform representations (e.g. perceptions and memories) via inference, induction, deduction, analogy, identification of similarities and differences, categorization, and the manipulation of concepts.

Cognitive Imaginative: Imaginative or creative thought depends on linguistic, mathematical, and Visio-spatial capacities to transform representations (e.g. perceptions and memories) in novel and non-obvious ways; this type of thinking may involve a greater degree of associative thinking, use of metaphor, lateral thinking, breaking of paradigms and rules, etc.

Cognitive Undetermined: This code is meant to capture cases when an excerpt is clearly cognitive, but the cognitive activity could be either imaginative OR analytical. For example, a facilitator might ask a question that calls for impressions of a passage in a text. Responses to that question could be either imaginative

Cognitive Undetermined *(continued)***:** (e.g. use of an inventive metaphor) or analytical (parsing the meaning of a particular word as a tool to understand the meaning of the text). Therefore, the question is most appropriately coded as Cognitive-Undetermined.

Meta-Cognitive: Metacognition can describe theoretical or strategic occurrences. The first involves thinking about thinking, and the second self- regulation of cognition.

Affective Domains: This code captures occasions when the craftsman's methods engage, or are intended to engage, the emotional and motivational make-up of the audience or student. The affective domain also captures intrapersonal personality traits, for instance, independence of judgment, self-confidence, attraction to complexity, aesthetic orientation, openness to experience, risk-taking.

Intersubjective Domains: This code captures occasions when the craftsman's methods engage, or are intended to engage, the psychological orientation of the audience or student to other people. The intersubjective domain captures issues of attunement and/or misattunement as well as interpersonal personality traits, for instance empathy and perspectival flexibility.

Kinesthetic Domains: This code captures occasions when the craftsman's methods engage, or are intended to engage, the physical habits of the student or audience.

E - Types of Intellectual/Personality Development

Cognitive, affective, intersubjective, and kinesthetic capacities work together to develop a range of kinds of intelligence and personality factors. This code identifies the type of intelligence or personality factor that each craftsman seeks to cultivate.

Literacy Basic : Cultivation of basic language competence. See Common core State Standards for Language Standards, all grade levels.

E - Types of Intellectual/Personality Development *(continued)*

Literacy - Advanced: Advanced Literacy captures instances in which interpretive and critical reading skills are developed or deployed. These skills include, but are not limited to, 'intertextual skills," where readers draw connections among texts, as well as text-to-self skills, where readers draw connections between themselves or others and characters in a text. "Text" here refers to verbal content delivered in a formalized environment (spoken in a classroom or court, for instance, or published works). See Common Core State Standards for reading.

Communicative Skill: For the development of any skills related to speaking, writing, listening, and presenting, including preparing exhibits, slides, presentations, etc. See Common Core State Standards for writing, speaking, and listening.

Critical Thinking: Capacity to reason effectively, especially using analytical cognitive capacities. (See above for the definition of those.) Critical thinking is reactive, generative, and often evaluative.

Understanding: A synthetic grasp of the material (using either or both cognitive-analytical and cognitive-imaginative capacities) on the basis of which students can perform their own pro-active mental acts with the material or going beyond the material. Understanding is something that one achieves and performs.

Appreciation: Appreciation consists not only to understanding the reasoning or creative work of another with regard to how it works or what it does, but also of taking pleasure in it or assigning positive value to it. (Appreciation is just one of the pro-active mental acts that student-participants can perform on the basis of understanding, but it is a common one.)

Creativity: The ability to develop novel and non-obvious ideas, solutions, objects, practices, and expressive works.

Practical Judgment: The ability to reason soundly in answer to the question, "What should be done?" Such reasoning may be either pragmatic/strategic or ethical.

E - Types of Intellectual/Personality Development *(continued)*

Personality Factors: In addition to intellectual "muscles" that are clearly cognitive, psychological capacities also help develop personality factors like grit, perseverance, self-esteem, self-confidence, ambition, and resilience.

F - Types of Human Development

This code family captures the more distal capacities that develop as a result of the engagement of student-participants in the activity being described or experienced and that give shape to the longer-term arc of a life. Cognitive, affective, intersubjective, and kinesthetic capacities work together to develop a range of kinds of intelligence; these in term combine to support the development of the civic, existential, or vocational arcs of a life. This code identifies the distal capacities cultivated by the humanistic practice under consideration.

Civic: Empowerment for positive participation in the collective life of a community, including generation of a sense of ownership over a common world.

Existential: Empowerment for success at creative self-expression and world-making; and for success at rewarding relationships in spaces of intimacy and leisure.

Vocational: Empowerment for success at bread-winning work.

G - ?

This code is used to tag an excerpt where the coder has significant questions about how to code it.

APPENDIX B: Bibliography

Allen, Danielle. "Democracy and Education: three principles?" Unpublished essay on file with author.

---. *Education and Equality.* University of Chicago, 2016a.

---. "Education and Equality." Lecture given at the Institute for Advanced Study, Princeton, New Jersey, November 16, 2011. Accessed online: http://video.ias.edu/stream&ref=784

---. "Helping Students Find Their Place in the World." *Washington Post,* September 23, 2012. Accessed online: https://www.washingtonpost.com/opinions/helping-students-find-thei -place-in-the-world/2012/09/23/64552334-029a-11e2-8102-ebee9c66e190_story.html

---. "The Humanities and the Principle of Economy," in *Humanities* (Magazine of the National Endowment for the Humanities), March/April, 2016b.

---. "The Humanities and Civic Education," in *Humanities* (Magazine of the National Endowment for the Humanities), March/April, 2016c.

---. "A Multilingual America?" *Soundings,* 87 (2004): 259–80.

---. Talking to Strangers: *Anxieties of Citizenship Since Brown v. Board of Education.* Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2004.

Allen, Danielle, and Robert Reich, eds. *Education, Justice, and Democracy.* Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2013.

American Academy of Arts and Sciences. *Introducing the Humanities Indicators: An Online Prototype of National Data Collection in the Humanities.* Cambridge: American Academy of Arts and Sciences, 2009.

American Council of Learned Societies. *A Report to the Congress of the Uited States on the State of the Humanities and the Reauthorization of the National Endowment for the Humanities.* New York: American Council of Learned Societies, 1985.

---. *Our Cultural Commonwealth: the Report of the American Council of Learned Societies Commission on Cyberinfrastructure for the Humanities and Social Sciences.* New York: American Council of Learned Societies, 2006.

Anderson, Elizabeth. "Fair Opportunity in Education; A Democratic Equality Perspective." *Ethics,* 117:4 (2007): 595–622.

Arts Council England. 2016. "Toolkits." Available at: http://www.artscouncil.org.uk/advice-and-guidance-library/toolkits.

Arum, Richard, and Josipa Roska. *Academically Adrift.* Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2011.

Bachen, Christine, Chad Raphael, Kathleen-M Lynn, Kristen McKee, & Jessica Philippi. "Civic Engagement, Pedagogy, And Information Technology On Web Sites For Youth." *Political Communication,* 25:3 (2008): 290-310.

Banaji, Shakuntala. "Framing Young Citizens: Explicit Invitation And Implicit Exclusion On Youth Civic Websites." *Language and Intercultural Communication,* 11:2 (2011): 126-141.

Bennett, Lance, and Michael Xenos. (2005). "Young voters and the web of politics 2004: The youth political Web sphere comes of age." *CIRCLE Working Paper 42.* Accessed online: http://www.civicyouth.org/PopUps/WorkingPapers/WP42BennettXenos.pdf

Bennett, Lance, Chris Wells, and Deen Freelon. "Communicating Citizenship Online: Models of Civic Learning in the Youth Web Sphere." *Civic Learning Online Project.* 2009. Accessed online: www.engagedyouth.org

Boyer, John, ed. *The Aims of Education: the College of the University of Chicago.* Chicago: University of Chicago, 1997 & 2009.

Brodhead, Richard. "In Praise of the Humanities and the 'Fire that Never Goes Out,'" *Duke Today,* October 23, 2011.

—. "Advocating for the Humanities," *Duke Today*, March, 19, 2012.

Bromberg, Philip., and Allan Schore. *The Shadow of the Tsunami: and the Growth of the Relational Mind.* New York: Routledge, 2011.

Broughton, Janet. "Commencement for Programs in Celtic, Comparative Literature, Dutch, French, German, Italian, Portuguese, Scandinavian, Slavic, Spanish." U.C. Berkeley: Commencement Address, 2010.

Bruner, Jerome. *Toward a Theory of Instruction.* Cambridge, Mass.: Belknap Press, 1974.

Commission on the Humanities. *Report of the Commission on the Humanities*. New York: American Council of Learned Societies, 1964.

Commission on the Humanities. *The Humanities in American Life: Report of the Commission on the Humanities*. Berkeley: University of California Press, c.1980. Accessed online: http://ark.cdlib.org/ark:/13030/ft8j49p1jc/

Community Toolbox. 2015. "Evaluating the Initiative." Available at: http://ctb.ku.edu/en/evaluating-initiative

Delbanco, Andrew. *College: What It Was, Is, and Should Be.* Princeton: Princeton University Press. 2012.

Dewey, John. *Moral Principles in Education,* n.d.

Doumas, Leonidas, and Hummel, John. "Approaches to Modeling Human Mental Representations: What Works, What Doesn't, and Why," in *The Cambridge Handbook of Thinking and Reasoning.* Edited by Keith Holyoak and Robert Morrison, 73-94. New York: Cambridge University Press, 2005.

English, James. "Who Says English is a Dying Discipline?," *Chronicle of Higher Education*, September 17, 2012. Accessed online: http://chronicle.com/article/Who-Says-English-Is-a-Dying/134410/

Erikson, Erik H. *Childhood and Society*. Reissue edition. New York: W. W. Norton & Company, 1993.

Fairclough, Norman. *Analysing Discourse: Textual Analysis for Social Research.* London ; New York: Routledge, 2003.

Galucci, Robert. "How Scholars Can Improve International Relations," *Chronicle of Higher Education*, November 26, 2012. Accessed online: *http://chronicle.com/article/How-Scholars-Can-Improve/135898/*

Gardner, Howard E. Frames of Mind: the Theory of Multiple Intelligences. New York: Basic Books, 1983.

---. *Good Work: When Excellence and Ethics Meet*. New York: Basic Books, 2001.

---. *Multiple Intelligences: New Horizons in Theory and Practice*. Reprint edition. Basic Books, 2006.

Gerodimos, Roman. "Mobilising Young Citizens in the UK: A Content Analysis of Youth and Issue Websites," *Information, Communication & Society*, 11:7 (2008): 964-988.

---. "New Media, New Citizens: The Terms And Conditions Of Online Youth Civic Engagement" (PhD diss., Bournemouth University, 2010).

Goldstone, Robert, and Ji Son. "Similarity," in *The Cambridge Handbook of Thinking and Reasoning*. edited by Keith Holyoak, and Robert Morrison, 13-36. New York: Cambridge University Press, 2005.

Greeno, James G. "The Situativity of Knowing, Learning, and Research." *American Psychologist* 53, no. 1 (1998): 5.

Gutmann, Amy, ed. Freedom of Association. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1998.

---. *Democratic Education*. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1999.

Heiland, Donna, and Laura Rosenthal. *Literary Study, Measurement, and the Sublime: Disciplinary Assessment*. New York: The Teagle Foundation, 2011.

Hillygus, D. Sunshine. "The Missing Link: Exploring the Relationship Between Higher Education and Political Engagement," *Political Behavior*, 27:1 (2005): 25-47.

Hirschman, Sarah. *People and Stories: Who Owns Literature?* Communities Find Their Voice through Short Stories. iUniverse, 2009.

Holt, John. *How Children Learn*. Revised edition. Da Capo Press, 2009.

Holyoak, Keith J., and Robert G. Morrison, eds. *The Cambridge Handbook of Thinking and Reasoning*. New York: Cambridge University Press, 2005.

---. "Thinking and Reasoning: A Reader's Guide." in *The Cambridge Handbook of Thinking and Reasoning*. edited by Keith Holyoak, and Robert Morrison, 1-12. New York: Cambridge University Press, 2012.

Honneth, Axel. "Integrity and Disrespect: Principles of a Conception of Morality Based on the Theory of Recognition." *Political Theory* 20, no. 2 (May 1, 1992): 187–201.

Jackson, Philip. *Life in Classrooms*. New York: Holt, Rinehart & Winston, 1968.

Jay, Paul, and Gerald Graff. "Fear of Being Useful," *Inside Higher Education*, January 5, 2012. Accessed online: http://www.insidehighered.com/views/2012/01/05/essay-new-approach-defend-value-humanities#.T0Tw_WhErgk.facebook

Kaufman, James, and Robert Sternberg, eds. *The Cambridge Handbook of Creativity.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2010.

Keohane, Nannerl. "The Liberal Arts as Signposts in the 21st Century," *Chronicle of Higher Education*, January 29, 2012. Accessed online: *http://chronicle.com/article/The-Liberal-Arts-as-Guideposts/130475/*

Kidd, Daniel and Emanuele Castano, "Reading Literary Fiction Improves Theory of Mind." *Science* vol. 342 (October 18, 2013): 377-380.

Kiley, Kevin. "Making the Case," *Inside Higher Education*, November 19th, 2012. Accessed online: *http://www.insidehighered.com/news/2012/11/19/liberal-arts-colleges-rethink-their-messaging-face-criticism*

Kohlberg, Lawrence. "The Moral Atmosphere of the School" *In The Unstudied Curriculum: Its Impact on Children*, edited by Norman Overly, 104–239. Washington: Association for Supervision and Curriculum Development, NEA, 1970.

Laden, Anthony. "Learning to be Equal." *In Education, Justice, and Democracy*. edited by Danielle Allen, and Robert Reich, 62-79. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2013.

Lareau, Annette. *Unequal Childhoods: Class, Race, and Family Life. 2nd ed*. Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press, 2011.

LeBoeuf, Robyn, and Shafir, Eldar. "Decision Making," in *The Cambridge Handbook of Thinking and Reasoning*. edited by Keith Holyoak, and Robert Morrison, 243-66. New York: Cambridge University Press, 2005.

Levinson, Miera. *No Citizen Left Behind*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 2012.

Livingstone, Sonia. "The Challenge of Engaging Youth Online: Contrasting Producers' and Teenagers' Interpretations of Websites." *European Journal of Communication* 22:2 (2007): 165-184.

Macedo, Stephen, Yvette Alex-Assensoh, Jeffrey Berry, Michael Brintnall, David Campbell, Luis Fraga, Archon Fung, William Galston, Christopher Karpowitz, Margaret Levi, Meira Levinson, Keena Lipsitz, Richard G. Niemi, Robert Putnam, Wendy Rahn, Rob Reich, Robert Rodgers, Todd Swanstrom, and Katherine Walsh. *Democracy at Risk: How Political Choices Undermine Citizen Participation, and What We Can Do About It*. Washington: Brookings Institution, 2005.

Mathae, Katherine, and Catherine Birzer, eds. *Reinvigorating the Humanities: Enhancing Research and Education on Campus and Beyond.* Washington, D.C.: Association of American Universities, 2004.

McFarland, Daniel, and Reuben Thomas. "Bowling Young: How Youth Voluntary Associations Influence Adult Political Participation." *American Sociological Review*, 71 (2010): 401–25.

Miles, M. B., & Huberman, A. M. (1994). *Qualitative Data Analysis: An Expanded Sourcebook* (1st ed.). Thousand Oaks, Calif: Sage.

Miles, Matthew B., A. Michael Huberman, and Johnny Saldaña. *Qualitative Data Analysis: A Methods Sourcebook.* Third Edition edition. Thousand Oaks, Califorinia: SAGE Publications, Inc, 2013.

Milner, Henry. *The Internet Generation: Engaged Citizens or Political Dropouts*. Medford, MA: Tufts University Press, 2010.

Moglen, Seth. "Sharing Knowledge, Practicing Democracy: A Vision for the Twenty-First-Century University." In *Education, Justice, and Democracy*, edited by Danielle Allen, and Robert Reich, 267–84. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2013.

Morrill, Richard. "What is the Value of Liberal Education," *Huffington Post*, November 6, 2012. Accessed online: *http://www.huffingtonpost.com/richard-morrill/liberal-education_b_2083994.html*

Nussbaum, Martha. *Poetic Justice: the Literary Imagination and Public Life*. Boston: Beacon Press, 1996.

---. *Not for Profit: Why Democracy Needs the Humanities*. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2012.

Ober, Josiah. *Democracy and Knowledge: Innovation and Learning in Classical Athens*. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2008.

Pettit, Philip. *Republicanism: A Theory of Freedom and Government*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1997.

Porter, Catherine. "Presidential Address 2009: English Is Not Enough," *Publications of the Modern Language Association of America*, 125:3 (2010): 546-554. (Not placed on Spencer bibliography).

Research Councils UK. 2011. Evaluation: Practical Guidelines. A guide for evaluating public engagement activities. Available at: *http://www.snf.ch/SiteCollectionDocuments/agora_evaluationguide.pdf*.

Rips, Lance, and Douglas Medin. "Concepts and Categories: Memory, Meaning, and Metaphysics," in *The Cambridge Handbook of Thinking and Reasoning*. edited by Keith Holyoak, and Robert Morrison, 37-72. New York: Cambridge University Press, 2005.

Robins, Philip, and Murat Aydede, eds. *The Cambridge Handbook of Situated Cognition.* New York: Cambridge University Press, 2009.

Roth, Wolff-Michael, and Yew-Jin Lee. "'Vygotsky's Neglected Legacy': Cultural-Historical Activity Theory." *Review of Educational Research* 77, no. 2 (2007): 186–232.

Salovey, Peter and David Sluyter, eds. *Emotional development and emotional intelligence: Implications for educators*. New York: Basic Books, 1997.

Sawyer, R. Keith, ed. *The Cambridge Handbook of the Learning Sciences*. 2 edition. New York, NY: Cambridge University Press, 2014.

Schneider, Cynthia. "Cultural Diplomacy for the 21st Century: Empowering Local Voices," *Huffington Post*, February 22nd, 2012. Accessed online: *http://www.huffingtonpost.com/cynthia-p-schneider/cultural-diplomacy_b_1290487.html* (not placed on Spencer bibliography)

Seib, Philip. "A Strategy for Cultural Diplomacy." *Huffington Post*, January 5, 2012. Accessed online: *http://www.huffingtonpost.com/philip-seib/cultural-diplomacy_b_1184854.html*

Sennett, Richard. *The Craftsman*. New Haven: Yale, 2008.

Shorris, Earl. *The Art of Freedom: Teaching Humanities to the Poor*. New York: W.W. Norton, 2013.

Singer, Dorothy G., and Tracey A. Revenson. *A Piaget Primer: How a Child Thinks; Revised Edition*. Rev Sub edition. New York: Plume, 1996.

Stern, Mark J. and Susan C. Seifert. 2009. "Civic Engagement and the Arts: Issues of Conceptualization and Measurement." Animating Democracy: A Program of Americans for the Arts. Available at: http://animatingdemocracy.org/sites/default/files/CE_Arts_SternSeifert.pdf.

Sternberg, Robert, and Scott Kaufman, eds. *The Cambridge Handbook of Intelligence*. New York: Cambridge University Press, 2011.

Sternberg, Robert, Todd Lubart, James Kaufman, and Jean Pretz. "Creativity" in *The Cambridge Handbook of Thinking and Reasoning*. edited by Keith Holyoak, and Robert Morrison, 315-70. New York: Cambridge University Press, 2005.

Strauss, A., and J. Corbin. Basics of qualitative research: *Techniques and procedures for developing grounded theory. 3rd edition*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications, Inc., 2008.

Sunquist, Eric. "The Humanities and the National Interest," American Literary History, 24:3 (2012): 590-607.

Tversky, Barbara. "Visuospatial Reasoning" in *The Cambridge Handbook of Thinking and Reasoning*. edited by Keith Holyoak, and Robert Morrison, 209-42. New York: Cambridge University Press, 2005.

U.S. Department of Education, National Center for Educational Statistics. "Baccalaureate and Beyond Longitudinal Study." By Jennifer Wine, Melissa Cominole, Sara Wheeless, Kristin Dudley, and Jeff Franklin. NCES 2006-166. Washington, D.C.: U.S. Government Printing Office, 2006.

---. "Baccalaureate and Beyond Longitudinal Study." By Emily Cataldi, Caitlin Green, Robin Henke, Terry Lew, Jennie Woo, Bryan Shepherd, and Peter Siegel. NCES 2011-236. Washington, D.C.: U.S. Government Printing Office, 2011.

Walton, Gregory. "The Myth of Intelligence: Smartness Isn't Like Height." In *Education, Justice, and Democracy*, edited by Danielle Allen and Robert Reich, 155–72. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2013.

Wieseltier, Leon. "Education is the Work of Teachers, not Hackers," *The New Republic*, December 21, 2012. Accessed online: *http://www.tnr.com/article/politics/magazine/111376/the-unschooled#*

Xenos, Michael, and Bennett, Lance. "The Disconnection in Online Politics: The Youth Political Web Sphere and US Election Sites, 2002-2004." *Information, Communication, and Society*, 10:4 (2007): 443-464.

Yamagata-Lynch, Lisa C. *Activity Systems Analysis Methods: Understanding Complex Learning Environments*. 2010 edition. New York: Spring, 2010.

The HULA Research Team
Project Zero
Harvard University